

Traditions in Music Teacher Education in Chile: two case studies to understand responses to musical academicism and educational neoliberalism.¹

Felipe Javier Zamorano-Valenzuela²

Received: 20 August 2022 / Accepted: 9 March 2023

Abstract. This article aims to understand the ways in which the formative traditions underlying music teacher education programmes in Chile are represented. It introduces the topic through a brief historical review of Music Teacher Education in Chile, followed by a description of existing formative traditions in Music Teacher Education programmes internationally. This qualitative work presents two case studies carried out in the city of Santiago de Chile. Through information obtained from documentary analysis, observations, interviews and discussion groups, and the corresponding analysis, it is concluded that in Music Teacher Education there are both adaptive and radical proposals to the school reality, which combined with musical academicism and its forms of learning achieve unique and dissimilar experiences, some of them with conservative approach and others with critical approach.

Keywords: Music teacher education; training traditions; musical academicism; educational neoliberalism; case studies.

Tradiciones en la formación del profesorado de música en Chile: dos estudios de casos para entender las respuestas al academicismo musical y el neoliberalismo educativo.

Resumen. Este artículo tiene como objetivo comprender las formas en que se ven representadas las tradiciones formativas que subyacen en los planes de estudios de formación del profesorado de música en Chile. Se introduce al tema a través de una breve revisión histórica de la formación del profesorado de música en Chile, seguida de la descripción de tradiciones formativas existentes en los planes de estudios a nivel internacional. En este trabajo de corte cualitativo se exponen dos estudios de caso realizados en la ciudad de Santiago de Chile. A través de información obtenida del análisis documental, observaciones, entrevistas y grupos de discusión, y el correspondiente análisis, se concluye que en la formación del profesorado de música subyacen propuestas tanto adaptativas como radicales a la realidad escolar, las cuales combinadas con el academicismo musical y sus formas de aprendizaje logran experiencias únicas y disímiles, algunas de tinte conservador y otras de tinte críticos.

Palabras clave: Formación del profesorado de música; tradiciones formativas; academicismo musical; neoliberalismo educativo; estudios de caso.

Table of contents. Introduction: Music Teacher Education in Chile. 2. Traditions in Music Teacher Education. 3. Method. 4. Results. 5. Discussion and Conclusions. 6. References.

How to cite: Zamorano-Valenzuela, F. J. (2023). Traditions in Music Teacher Education in Chile: two case studies to understand responses to musical academicism and educational neoliberalism. *Revista Electrónica Complutense de Investigación en Educación Musical*, 20, 167-177. <https://dx.doi.org/10.5209/reciem.83488>

1. Introduction: Music Teacher Education in Chile.

The Music Teacher Education (MTE) in Chile began in 1889 with the creation of the Faculty of Education, seeking to promote musical institutionalism and new educational proposals for schools (Poblete, 2016). In 1906, the MTE was consolidated when the National Conservatory of Music ensured by decree that its graduates would be hired as teachers in Chilean schools (ibid.), a situation that would become a reality in 1935 when the Conservatory became

¹ This article is part of a doctoral thesis, which has been funded by the Fondo para el Fomento de la Música Nacional, line Formación y Becas, Proyecto N° 443508, Convocatoria 2018 (Ministerio de las Culturas, las Artes y el Patrimonio, Chile).

² Music Education Department, University of Zaragoza (Spain).
E-mail: fzamorano@unizar.es | ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1309-4726>

part of the Faculty of Fine Arts of the University of Chile (Poblete, 2017). Thus, began a teacher training that moved between this Faculty and the Faculty of Education (Núñez, 1960).

In terms of the orientation of the studies, the plans carried the tradition of cultured and elitist European music, due to musical universalism (Uribe, 2019) and the understanding of music as fine arts (Pino, 2015). As the decades progressed, with the 1968 reform, the MTE included folk music and music didactics in the valid knowledge base. This change evidenced the transition towards a position oriented towards responding to the needs of the school system (Poblete, 2016), i.e. music as a medium. However, the advances in the field of didactics and the influence of European music pedagogues would be limited by the military coup and the installation of the dictatorship (1973-1990). Chile, then, “was not only cut off from the institutional vanguard exercised in previous decades, but also from much of the debate and updating of the speciality” (Pino, 2015, p. 166).

In the administrative sphere, during the dictatorship of Augusto Pinochet, the atomisation of the University of Chile and its separation from the Pedagogical Institute (1981) was imposed, creating regional universities, with less economic power and probably less capacity for academic production. This crisis deepened once private universities entered the teacher training field, a situation that diversified the offer, deepened competition and called into question the professional nature of teacher training (Núñez, 2007; Silva-Peña & Peña-Sandoval, 2019), i.e. both the technical conception of teaching work and its separation from the role of researcher began to be legitimised (Núñez, 2007). These issues dealt a further blow to MTE, as the possibilities for research and reformulation in the field were curtailed.

In 1990, with the return to democracy and the total reopening to the world, the foundations of the neo-liberal model were reaffirmed. This led Chile to become the first South American country to join the OECD and to accept its economic rules, which had repercussions in the field of higher education, for example, in the use of ‘ideal’ training concepts based on international evidence (Cavieres-Fernández & Apple, 2016): standards. In this context, the first standards for MTE (and in which this research is framed) were published in 2014 by the Ministry of Education (MINEDUC). The work concluded with the proposal of two blocks of standards, which reflected an evident division between musical and pedagogical knowledge (Aranda et al., 2017). The Music Standards established musical competences (musical technique and knowledge of history and culture) and musical didactics, and the Pedagogical Standards for Primary and Secondary Education pointed to the need to know the students, the school culture and its diversity; to know the curriculum and to know how to design teaching and assessment strategies; and to know how to communicate effectively and reflect on practice (MINEDUC, 2014).

The current panorama of MTE in Chile shows 22 degrees, where only 8 degrees are offered by public institutions and 14 by private or traditional private universities; 16 degrees with the concurrent modality and 6 with the consecutive modality. In relation to the presence in Chilean territory, half of the regions do not have access to MTE, as the offer is concentrated in the capital and the Valparaíso region. Finally, music teachers in Chile are mostly prepared for the secondary level, then for primary and secondary levels, and only one programme for infant and primary levels.

2. Traditions in Music Teacher Education.

To speak of tradition is to speak of a set of theoretical conceptions and practical dispositions linked to values and habits that emerge from a collective memory in a physical or symbolic territory (Giddens, 1997). Tradition develops a historically delimited language that is configured on the basis of an ontology and epistemology of reference (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 2005). In the field of teacher training, traditions refer to “intergenerational patterns of thought and practice related and linked to certain educational objectives and values” (Liston & Zeichner, 1997, p. 70), establishing frameworks of observation and reflection and dynamics of socialisation that will have their correlate in how teachers construct professional identity (Tezanos, 2012). Hence, training proposals can be understood as spaces of ‘moral and social’ control, with certain validated knowledge that seek to build belonging to certain ways of being and thinking and to certain professional values (Giroux, 1997a). Thus, without neutrality, these educational foundations and actions encompass political commitments and project visions of the society to be achieved (Apple, 1997; Diker & Terigi, 1997; Périsset, 2018).

Zeichner and Liston (1990) establish four traditions, which explain the orientations of the MTE programmes and the reflexive focus where students learn to answer: what music is, how it is taught and what its role is within school and society. Firstly, the *academicist* tradition places teachers in a reflexive system that revolves around the discipline being taught. Here all teaching action begins and ends with the musical content (Ballantyne, 2006), with the reproduction of canonical knowledge through its teaching-learning methods being important (Janesick, 2003). It is understood, then, that the *academicist* tradition is linked to contents and methodologies that are carried over from musical Eurocentrism, that is, from the cultural canon given by the dominant classes (Aróstegui, 2011). In this way, musical skills are mainly developed based on Western repertoires of European and white musicians (Nierman et al., 2002), who use the score as an essential object-instrument for the teaching of music and the language that depends on it. This critically implies that, once the university student is minimised to the status of *ignoramus*, the figure of the teacher (i.e. the one who holds the disciplinary truth) must transmit everything about music (Freire, 2010). Thus, one

ends up learning a form of teaching and construction of the musical educational world that refers to the objectification and uncritical reproduction of the formative processes (Scheib, 2006).

For its part, the tradition of *social efficiency* promotes the learning of certain professional dispositions that seek to adapt to the school reality in order to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of teaching work, which can be seen as a product of the industrial economy and the business world (Díez-Gutiérrez, 2020; Giroux, 1997b). Teachers learn to justify their actions from the objective evidence of standards (Nierman et al., 2002) with a certain unrestricted and uncritical adherence to prescribed norms. In practical terms, MTE programmes attempt to focus on the development and acquisition of specific and observable skills and abilities for teaching: curriculum management, planning, methods and evaluative processes (Liston & Zeichner, 1997), as they would serve to adapt and manage ‘well’ in the school and improve its performance (Scheib, 2006). Thus, instead of music education, a form of training is established based on edicts and regular steps that teachers must learn in order to be consistent and efficient in achieving their goals (Bowman, 2018).

The *developmentalist* tradition aims at establishing curricular adaptations and methodological innovations on the basis of the developmental stages of children and young people. According to Liston and Zeichner (1997, paraphrasing Kliebard, 1986), “the most typical feature of this tradition is the assumption that the natural order of learner development is the basis for determining what is to be taught, both to pupils (...) and to their teachers” (p. 46). This implies that teachers learn to situate their actions from the systematic study of educational psychology with the intention of achieving creative and stimulating proposals depending on the levels of schooling (Ballantyne, 2006, 2007; Kirkman & Brownhill, 2020). In this way, some musical methods XX become useful steps and tools to stimulate students depending on the degree of motor and musical development, as they are based on psychological categories of children and young people’s behaviour (Jorquera, 2004).

Finally, the tradition of *social reconstruction* seeks teachers to reflect on the political implications of education (Nierman et al., 2002). This situated reflection in their teaching would enable them to act on the status quo and combat social inequalities (Kirkman & Brownhill, 2020), i.e. teachers are positioned as critical professionals focused on educating for social justice (Belavi & Murillo, 2020). For example, from a musical and decolonial perspective, the programmes understand the need to decentralise Western musical knowledge and its forms of teaching, as they are correlates of colonialist practices from which social injustices emanate, for example, racial and ethnic injustices (Stuhr, 1994). Students learn to de-centre cultured and elitist music from their mainstream knowledge, including other music and other knowledge outside the discipline and within the social contingency. This refers to the interpellation that, while this tradition is often marginalised by aesthetic ideology (Regelski, 2016), MTE “cannot be left out of any attempt to modify the sexual, gendered, spiritual, epistemic, political and racial hierarchies that the modern/colonial world system has imposed on us” (Shifres & Rosabal-Coto, 2017, p. 89).

In the Chilean context, empirical studies on MTE are scarce, although in recent years there has been a growing interest in research on this topic. For example, Poblete (2017) carries out a historical analysis of the university curriculum, and Aranda et al. (2017) focus on various components of it, such as the practice phase and the musical and pedagogical contents; Ángel-Alvarado (2018) investigates the musical training of generalist teachers; Zamorano-Valenzuela (2020) analyses the critical training of music teachers; and Iglesias and Rivera (2021) address the adaptation to the online format of teachers in training during the time of COVID. In this sense, the present work aims not only to contribute to a field in expansion, but also to understand its current situation in terms of the training traditions that rest on it and to propose reflections in academic bodies and university students themselves.

3. Method

This work, which is part of a doctoral thesis focused on the identity of music teachers, employs qualitative methodology, as it seeks to “represent and interpret the symbolic articulations, practices and forms of cultural production” (Willis, 2017, p. 19) of the MTE. This position understands MTE programmes as organic and dynamic bodies, where diverse and interwoven realities coexist. Specifically, the case study approach is used to understand and describe two unique realities in a given socio-political context (Bresler & Stake, 2006). A multi-case study makes it possible to investigate the same issue in the same context (Yin, 1981) in the existing teacher training modalities in Chile (consecutive and concurrent modalities). The research questions guiding this work are: What traditions underlie two MTE programmes in Chile with different training modalities? and how are they represented in the different training experiences given by the programmes?

3.1. Participants

Two degrees were chosen on the basis of the following criteria: 1) different training modality, 2) same city (for reasons of the researcher’s relocation) and, 3) minimum accreditation level of 6 years. Thus, access was gained to a degree from a private university which is offered in the concurrent modality and which trains teachers for primary and secondary education (C1) and to a degree from a public university which is offered in the consecutive modality and which trains teachers for secondary education (C2); both in the city of Santiago.

3.2. Materials

In order to capture common and dissimilar dimensions of the cases and to triangulate the data (Maykut & Morehouse, 2002), four methods of data collection were deployed over three months: documentary analysis to take an initial look at the official narrative of each degree programme, i.e. to learn about the internal structure of the curricula, their objectives, graduate profiles and the profile of the university teaching staff; non-participant observations in the university classroom in order to understand the forms of interaction between participants, as well as the working methodologies; semi-structured interviews to “uncover more than can be reliably detected or presumed from observation of a situation” (Simons, 2011, p. 11); and focus groups to learn about the ways in which prospective music teachers interact and collectively and publicly construct ideas (Valles, 1999). *Table 1* shows in detail the times each method was applied and the documents and subjects who were part of them.

Table 1. Details of information collection methods per case.

	Case 1	Case 2
Documentary analysis	Teaching guides, self-assessment report, accreditation agreement, graduate profile and website.	Teaching guides, syllabus regulations, self-evaluation report and website.
Non-participant observation	Observation of 60 sessions of both music and specific and general psycho-pedagogical subjects.	Observation of 35 sessions in the university classroom of specific and general psycho-pedagogical subjects.
Semi-structured interview	19 interviews with university teaching staff, students from different academic years and managers.	16 interviews with university teaching staff, students from different academic years and managers.
Discussion group	A focus group in which 11 students from different academic years participated.	A focus group in which 7 students from different academic years participated.

For the construction of these methods, a qualitative matrix created and used by researchers of the ALFA II-0448-A project (Aróstegui, 2010) was taken as a reference, which was updated in 2018 for the PROFMUS project (Serrano et al., 2020). This qualitative template sought to reconstruct and understand the formative experience offered by MTE programmes internationally. The general and initial topics of analysis were the conception and structure of the curriculum, the academic-musical characteristics of students and university faculty, and the ways in which teaching-learning processes are developed in the university classroom.

3.3. Procedures

The contact and access to the cases was given to the managers via email. In C1, the director of the degree programme at the time was contacted, who, according to his own information, was about to leave the post. After his approval, the new director was contacted, who had already been informed about the research. In relation to C2, access was given through some academics, who had been professors and work colleagues of the researcher, as he had studied and worked in this place. Although I had prior knowledge of the field to be investigated, I must point out that access was not easy. However, the process began after sending an explanatory research document and talking on-line with the deputy director.

Data collection began with the compilation of teaching guides, information on websites and other documents. A (remote) analysis began, which allowed us to theoretically approach the training realities of the cases (Peña & Pirela, 2007). Once landed in Santiago, Chile, and after agreeing on the start of the fieldwork, non-participant observations began in the university classrooms. These observations took place in the mornings in C1 and in the afternoons in C2, given the timetables they offered. These observations made it possible to get to know the future participants in the interviews and focus groups.

Data analysis is understood as a process of constant revision and interpretation. This means, this analysis follows the *circular model* (Flick, 2016), as it continuously transits between theory, emerging themes and collected data to give a deeper and more holistic look. In addition, the back and forth during the morning and afternoon to each of the cases, and the simultaneous (and circular) analysis provided the opportunity to complexify the reflections and contrast views on MTE. In this sense, it is important to make clear that, although each of the cases investigated are individual units of interpretation (with historical developments, economic situations, formative modalities and, in short, contexts that make these cases unique), and their comparison is not the aim of the study, the reader can draw their own conclusions from the contrast (Stake, 2006).

4. Results

The case studies discussed below represent unique and unrepeatable realities. They shed light on training experiences that can serve as a reference for reflection on the construction of teacher professionalism in curricular spaces with certain training traditions. The study in which this article is framed reinterpreted the initial categories and established three common levels of analysis for the understanding of the cases: 1) The curriculum, its structure, load and conceptions; 2) The methodologies and environments of the university classroom and outside it, and 3) The students' transit, their experiences and beliefs about the teaching role. These categories and their details made it possible to visualise various relevant aspects related to the traditions underlying their curricula. In both cases refer to similar ways of constructing musical knowledge and dissimilar ones in the field of pedagogical knowledge. Before going into the description of the cases, it is necessary to note that the names of the participants have been changed in order to anonymise their identities.

CASE 1: Musical academicism with variations and the search for “good teaching”.

This degree was created in 2001, by a private university and offers the title of music teacher for primary and secondary school in the concurrent modality. The latter implies that young people recently graduated from secondary school and with dissimilar musical backgrounds enter to train as teachers for 10 semesters in curricular spaces with musical subjects (49%), followed by musical psycho-pedagogical subjects (20%) and general psycho-pedagogical subjects (18%), leaving subjects dealing with socio-cultural themes (4%) and communication and languages (9%) on the margins.

Musical academicism and folk repertoires

The curriculum is mainly characterised by the promotion of cultured and elitist music through its musical language, although it is complemented by folkloric and traditional expressions from Chile and Latin America. Although musical diversity could be a catalyst for the use of diverse forms of musical codification, the promotion of Western musical language is positioned as the basis of teaching knowledge and the articulating axis of musical and musical pedagogical subjects. The directors first establish a diagnostic test to measure the students' musical reading ability and, as the case may be, to reinforce and balance dissimilar musical knowledge. This points to the importance of consolidating the basics of the language, which are indispensable, and which must be put into play in the qualification and in future teaching work. In this sense, explicitly, the subject of Music Language (in its four versions) aims to enable students to:

“approach the different aspects of their musical training, through the study of the graphic and formal aspects of music. The aim is to develop the ability to decode musical symbols and auditory discrimination. At this level, pupils will acquire the basic elements of musical notation with tonal characteristics, which will enable them to understand and develop in the language of Western music” (Teacher Guide: Music Language).

This reveals the need to learn the codes of musical language from an academic perspective through the ‘score’ support, which will enable future teachers to exercise their profession effectively. In relation to this framework, that of musical language, students learn a certain diversity, both from the point of view of musical repertoire and artistic expressions, mostly for the purpose of adapting to school reality.

“You know that classical music has been the queen of the classroom for years. So, we try to ensure that, yes, it may continue to be, but that we also include other elements due to the diversity of pupils in the classroom” (Interview: teacher Ángel).

These words of the professor of the *Traditional Chilean Culture Course* (and a reference for the students in the case) give a glimpse of the musical diversity centred on cultured and elitist music, which would allow the incipient development of multi-functionality, again and again pointed out by this same university professor:

“[We train teachers who] play, sing and dance... classical music, popular music, traditional music” (Interview: teacher Ángel).

This arrangement of two axes, one of artistic expressions and the other of musical genres, would allow the longed-for efficiency and effectiveness of this future teaching staff in the complex reality of the school. In this way, musical diversity with a clear focus on academic music seeks to be used as a didactic means of articulation between music and school work, which will probably be accompanied by its valuation, i.e. musical academicism as ‘fine arts’ and other musical expressions ‘as an educational means’.

Parcelled practices and didactics: the psychological perspective for effectiveness

Insisting on the search for the effectiveness of its students, it is proposed that all teaching action should be linked to the observation of students as subjects who evolve psychologically and culturally. This implies that the curriculum is based on:

“the socio-cognitive paradigm to guide students during their training towards understanding aspects related to the evolutionary development of children and young people. The aim is for theory to be accompanied by the acquisition of models and techniques that favour effective educational interventions in their pedagogical action” (Self-evaluation report 2014).

The trainee teacher must then construct effective activities in the music classroom on the basis of an analysis of the behaviour and growth stages of the students (e.g. on the developmental stages). This is perhaps closely related to those internal divisions of, for example, the practice phase and the didactics for each level of schooling. In the case of internships, students are confronted with experiences divided by levels of depth and by levels of schooling, i.e. four semesters of internships, the first two in primary education, and then two for secondary education, both with a first semester of observation and the following semester of intervention. This proposal, which could be reasonable given the wide range of objectives and tasks for the different levels of the school, would be evidence of the strong control of the learning experience with the aim of making its students effective.

For its part, the didactic sequence is divided into three steps: the first in decoding the elements of music and developing strategies for its teaching; the second in revising the primary music curriculum, exercising 20th century musical methods and creating didactic material; and the third in revising the secondary curriculum, planning lessons and creating didactic resources. This logical sequence in terms of the relevance of musical language and the levels of schooling finds its centre in the promotion of 20th century musical methods:

“We learn what methodology to use. We learn many methods of... Dalcroze, Orff, with the Orff instruments. One that Rudolf Steiner used, the Suzuki we also learned. We learnt many ways of teaching music, from the pedagogical side and how to work with it. And to see which one was ‘better’, in inverted commas, or to make a mixture of all of them” (Interview: student Tomás).

It seems then that once again an attempt is being made to safeguard efficient and effective knowledge about the music classroom, now through didactics divided into levels and the explicit promotion of methods from the last century. In this way, this approach is installed as the general foundation of this degree and as an epistemology that refers to how and what knowledge to build in relation to music education at its various levels and with its different steps.

Good teaching as an objective framework: knowing how to manage oneself

The case insistently promotes external rules for teaching, seeking that the future music teacher be instructed efficiently and effectively for a more or less certain and objective school context. *The Framework for Good Teaching* (MINEDUC, 2008) becomes relevant once the university teachers continually refer to the formative criteria to be achieved in order to give some assurance of the quality of music teaching. This provision is expressed in the words of the lecturer in charge of coordinating the practical phase:

“Here we use the Framework for Good Teaching, which has 4 domains. For example, domain number 1 has to do with professional knowledge, i.e. that you know what you are teaching. Number 2 is going to have to do with the atmosphere that you create in the classroom. And number 3, which is tremendously important, is education for all students. So, in a class we can see if he really knows about baroque music because he got into baroque music. We are going to realise if he is indeed creating a favourable environment so that all the students can listen to what he is doing or can receive it, and, above all, that his work is going to be for all the students” (Interview: teacher Ángel).

The importance of this official MINEDUC document is clearly revealed by the attention paid by this university professor to building effective music teachers in each of the mandated dimensions: content management, teaching environment and attention to diversity. As a correlate of this question, the same university professor points out that the instruments for evaluating the performance of the practices are made in relation to this framework of ideals:

“This year all the practice documents are still under review, and we are evaluating the modifications because the Teacher Career Law is coming up. In the Teacher Career Law, there is a lot of action with the Framework for Good Teaching... So, we are looking at, and today we have a meeting, to review how we can transform this framework into a rubric that can be, at least domain A, B and C, part of the observation that we make in the classroom... The revision is constant, I would say” (Interview: teacher Ángel).

In this way, the search for coherence between the tasks of the sequence of practices, the professional profile of the syllabus and external training criteria related to the Teaching Career Law is exposed. Thus, the Framework for Good Teaching becomes a fundamental pillar in the training of this music teacher, as it seeks adaptation to its criteria that refer both to ‘quality’ teaching within schools and to dimensions in which music teachers will be evaluated for their consequent categorisation. This would mean that there is a high level of concern for training music teachers who conform to these guidelines and who respond satisfactorily to their evaluations. The prestige of the university, of the degree and of the music teachers themselves will probably depend on the success of these assessments.

CASE 2: From Conservatory Music to Critical Pedagogy

This degree was created in 1994, is offered consecutively and awards the title of secondary school teacher for various specialisations, including music. This means that musicians with at least 5 years of university musical training are trained pedagogically for three semesters alongside professionals from other disciplines, in two types of spaces: music psycho-pedagogical subjects (40%), for example, music didactics (37.5%), evaluation (37.5) and digital technologies (25%); and general psycho-pedagogical subjects (60%) for all subjects, including research (47%), history and sociology (17%), psychology (14%), curriculum (10%), citizenship training for schools (8%) and others of an optional focus (4%).

Musical academicism: what students are bringing in

The consecutive modality offered by this degree has to cope with the extensive and profound musical training that students bring with them, which refers to a 'conservatory' musical academicism. This previous musical training is experienced as a cultural bubble, with high competence and common ways of learning musical language. The students point out that their university musical training has circulated within a culturally closed space, as the repertoires have referred to cultured and elitist music to the detriment of popular and folkloric music:

“[The] conservatory, it’s a bubble as a cultural bubble. Trying to propose other styles is very difficult, it’s very frowned upon. For example, when I was at the university, there was a Big Band project that was kind of ignored by the more conservative professors” (Interview: student Rodrigo).

This reveals that the students in the case study have been formed under a somewhat static musical tradition that prevents the inclusion of new ideas in the discipline, probably due to the rules of musical language and the onto-epistemic barriers surrounding the institution. To this the students add the strong competition within their musical formations. For example, Gonzalo, a student who entered at the age of 15 to train as a guitar player adds:

“The teacher always made us play, but it was like a competition, that is... what could be if you managed to win a space in the [Music Hall Isidora] Zegers, because he thought you were playing well. And there was a list of about ten others who were playing, who wanted the same thing. So, there was a very tense atmosphere” (Interview: student Gonzalo).

It would seem, then, that musical training is emotionally draining due to the competition between aspiring performers and the work involved in developing a refined technique. Finally, some common denominators related to music learning are presented. For example, Juan clarifies these aspects between music training institutions in Chile, both public and private, where he has worked.

“I was struck by the fact that there were many texts that were similar in the three schools: at the University of Chile, the UMCE and the Arcos. There were study texts, music reading texts, solfège theory texts. Concepts too... And contents that, in themselves, were very similar, practically the same. So, what I could point out is that in these schools the predominant system is the classical-romantic music system. So, therefore, there is a whole learning process that goes from theory to practice, to interpretation, and through concepts such as solfège, rhythm, harmony” (Interview: student Juan).

This reveals an overview of three institutions of higher education in relation to the established musical tradition and the ways of learning that are based on it: the classical-romantic tradition of classical harmony and methods of musical learning which, as Nettl (1995) says, are dedicated to the perpetuation and veneration of the great masters. This conception would ultimately correspond to the Beethovenian (i.e. bourgeois European) model of classical music which, at the time, i.e. two hundred years ago, was revolutionary (e.g. Baricco, 1999).

The history of teachers and what is happening on the street

This case is shown as a space for systematic reflection and discussion, which contrasts with the musical training described above. This refers to the sociological reconstruction of educational phenomena, starting with the personal educational history and that of the teaching staff, and followed by critical reflection on the Chilean educational system (the school and the learner). From a broad perspective, the curriculum expects:

“That teachers are able to carry out a situated professional exercise, that they also develop a critical view of centralised national curriculum policies... We hope that graduates will be autonomous teachers in their decisions, that they will not just be passive applicators of a national curriculum because for that you have technical or neo-conductive teacher profiles.... We have a more constructivist and socio-critical approach” (Interview: former coordinator).

The idea of reconstruction, in the first place, implies reflecting individually and as a group on the biography of the students, asking questions about their passage through the educational system and the relationships built between student-teacher and student-knowledge. This would make it possible to understand the socio-cultural and educational

changes in order to consider the future teaching work with a broad perspective. And, secondly, it refers to a historical reflection on the role of Chilean teaching collectives with the aim of seeking the foundations of current educational problems and thinking about proposals.

Following the historical review, work is done on reflecting on school and social problems using research as a tool. This implies looking at teaching work as political work within society, i.e. a teaching profession that understands that its actions must focus on or be accompanied by a view of the current situation:

“[In the workshops we work on] intercultural projects. They are always projects to rescue the children’s identities, encouraging dialogue between the different cultures present in the classroom, without making any of them invisible, and always making room for all the students. From reflection in the first semester, to action in the following semesters, especially in the Workshop. Well, the workshop itself is a very political subject. This multicultural workshop, then, gives a lot of space to these projects with a lot of politics behind them” (Interview: student Rodrigo).

Therefore, the curriculum establishes a frame of reference based on the tradition of *social reconstruction* through a political view of teaching work, i.e. seeking to look behind the visible reality. In this space, during a group discussion, students interpret the syllabus proposal by establishing the supposed role they will have to assume as music teachers.

Student Andrés: “I also agree with what Cristian said that [the curriculum] has given us the material to develop our classes from a critical perspective where opinion is important, the development of knowledge and also knowing and understanding ourselves as historical subjects who are capable of generating realities... So, I completely agree that the development of pedagogy is a profoundly political act... But it is also easy to fall into the more reproductivist model, which is what the Chilean curriculum is also looking for. In other words, we still have to counterbalance this a little so that reflections are generated and people are generated who will have clear and well-founded ideals and thoughts in the future”.

Student Rodrigo: “I think exactly the same. When working with people, in this case children, school, teachers, directors, parents... there is already political work behind it. When I make decisions about what I am going to do in certain situations, that is a political act, it is a political decision. So, everything we do as teachers in the school context is a political decision. From criticising this person yes and no, from supporting, from challenging for these things, from encouraging this, from giving your point of view on certain things, from... Or allocating your class to only working on the subject is also a political decision, like making invisible what is happening outside and wanting to make my class a bubble”.

In this way, students recognise the tension between what the curriculum seeks to promote and the reality of the education system. This refers to the fact that the critical disposition promoted would bring about political decisions around music and society, the disciplining of students and what issues to include or leave out of teaching, for example, the problems that afflict students and their communities.

5. Discussion and Conclusions

Understanding the traditions that revolve around MTE serves initially to understand the current state of training. However, its main value lies in the fact that possible reflections related to teachers’ beliefs and practices can install breakpoints for alternative proposals (Jorgensen, 2003). This means that tradition can initially be seen as a space of stable beliefs due to convergent thinking constructed by its advocates, but from which oppositions and innovation alternatives can also emerge through critical reflection and divergence (Kuhn, 1977). In this way, traditions would implicitly notify the conception that teachers develop about the school and its students: either as a certain space with replicable objectivities or as an uncertain space with constant subjectivities and uncertainties (Serrano et al., 2020).

In conclusion, it can be pointed out that, although the cases show completely dissimilar realities both in their configuration and in their training proposals, they show a common denominator in the total training path (before or during) of the students: the cultured and elitist musical language and its repertoires. This implies that, although attempts are made to move in other musical directions with popular repertoires, the musical centre is the centre and does not move from there. While this might be a problem at MTE, the fact is that the traditions that accompany the academicist tradition of music shape new ideas about teaching and music, more or less radical, more or less adaptive to the parameters of teaching and society.

On the one hand, the case of the private university and its concurrent modality programme, C1, shows an education that adopts reflective focuses and elements from different traditions, although the *academic* tradition is at the centre of the curriculum, taking Western musical language and its repertoires as the basis for the development of musical alternatives provided by popular and folk music. It is complemented by the *developmentalist* and *social efficiency* traditions, which propose a psychological view of music with didactic and practice intervention scales on the one hand, and classroom management and standards-based planning on the other. The combination of these three traditions would give different tools to music teachers, as music education would be adapted to the visions of the

music school and the music classroom. This implies that formative approaches centred on standards and psychological perspectives refer to the search for certainty about school spaces with the aim of putting musical knowledge to school use, even more so when it is centred on the Western musical canon (Shifres & Rosabal-Coto, 2017). In this way, these respective reflective focuses and teaching actions in one way or another, give the future music teacher the illusion of developing pedagogical and musical competences and skills. This illusion refers to the certainty and objectification promised by the curricula, which somehow prefixes (or not, in case it does not achieve its purpose) the trainee teacher's actions through external measures, formulas and trial and error. This configuration would promote a certain technocratic rationality in the teaching culture where theoretical and political issues are rather secondary (to put it optimistically) in contrast to the instruction and development of "forty-seven different models of teaching, administration or assessment. They are not taught instead to be critical of these models" (Giroux, 1997b, p. 48), i.e. they are taught to be practical, lacking complexity and controversy (Bowman, 2013).

For its part, the case of the public university and its consecutive modality programme, C2, attempts to build a critical professionalism under the tradition of *social reconstruction*, which must be integrated into the *academic* tradition given by the musical training that the students bring with them. This formative counterpoint, which results in an *epistemological clash* (Zamorano-Valenzuela, 2021), implies putting in tension the ways of constructing a certain type of knowledge, for example, rather than being trained in relation to musical language standards, mainly European repertoires and with the unidirectionality of teaching by the 'maestro', these students build an identity given by reflection on school and society and general psycho-pedagogical themes. This type of training allows them to open up their conceptions of music and its teaching, and at first to disavow the former, i.e. they move between university training with radical epistemological proposals. Although it could be an exercise of the imagination, it would be necessary to consider what would have happened to these students in a consecutive modality degree, but with a proposal under traditions, either of *social efficiency* (standards or competences) or *developmentalist* (psychological). Perhaps the example of C1 can give us some clues about this, but what is certain is that these students learn to reconstruct their histories in order to project new forms of music teaching for schools. However, the question remains as to how these future music teachers will be able to articulate their socio-educational and musical interests with effective and efficient teaching processes, as the school, rather than being a space for the development of proposals that question the system, seems to focus on the training of subjects for the labour market through tasks that lack questioning (Shifres & Rosabal-Coto, 2017).

MTE in Chile seems to be beginning to divide between external standards and didactic steps, on the one hand, and attention to socio-political problems, on the other. Although these proposals could be seen as radical, it is true that the former is more a product of a certain neoliberal conception that seeks to make teachers approach externally given norms without reflection (Laval, 2004; Sachs, 2005). In this sense, between the real spaces of radicalism, either of musical academicism or of social reconstruction, there are traditions that assume the music teacher as a neutral professional who must seek efficacy and efficiency in his or her actions (Díez-Gutiérrez, 2020). This is evidence that curricula are similar to cultural fields for ideological battle (Varkøy, 2007) where arguments are presented for and against various educational-disciplinary values that accommodate spaces, times and ways of relating to and interpreting knowledge and, therefore, constructing a professional identity. In this space, the important thing seems to be the promotion of a diverse knowledge that allows students to reflect from different points of view on their roles within the school and society (Day, 2014), which in a way implies learning to be a teacher through certain and uncertain situations. This desire could then be a good example of formative justice with future music teachers, as by sharing with them the educational world in its various forms and from different traditions, their possibility of building themselves as educational professionals is likely to be safeguarded.

6. References

- Ángel-Alvarado, R. (2018). Formación inicial del profesorado generalista en Chile: Análisis desde la perspectiva de la educación musical. *Revista de Docencia Universitaria*, 16(1), 87–101. <https://doi.org/10.4995/redu.2018.7038>
- Apple, M. W. (1997). *Educación y poder*. Paidós.
- Aranda, R., Carrillo, C., & Casals, A. (2017). Formación del profesorado de música en Chile: dos casos en la ciudad de Valparaíso. *DEBATES-Cadernos do Programa de Pós-Graduação em Música*, 18, 248-278. <http://www.seer.unirio.br/index.php/revistadebates/article/view/6528>
- Aróstegui, J. L. (2010). Formación del Profesorado de Música: Planes de Estudio en Europa y América Latina. *Profesorado. Revista de Currículum y Formación del Profesorado*, 12(2), 3-7. <http://www.ugr.es/~rectpro/rev142ed.pdf>
- Aróstegui, J. L. (2011). Por un currículo contrahegemónico: de la educación musical a la música educativa. *Revista da ABEM*, 19(25), 19-29. http://abemeducacaomusical.com.br/revista_abem/ed25/revista25_artigo2.pdf
- Ballantyne, J. (2006). What Music Teachers Want: The Emergence of a Unified Understanding of an Ideal Teacher Education Course. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 31(1), 2-11. <https://doi.org/10.14221/ajte.2006v31n1.1>
- Ballantyne, J. (2007). Integration, contextualization and continuity: Three themes for the development of effective music teacher education programmes. *International Journal of Music Education*, 25(2), 119-136. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761407079955>
- Baricco, A. (1999). *El alma de Hegel y las vacas de Wisconsin*. Siruela.
- Belavi, G., & Murillo, F. J. (2020). Democracia y Justicia Social en las Escuelas: Dimensiones para Pensar y Mejorar la Práctica Educativa. *Revista Iberoamericana sobre Calidad, Eficacia y Cambio en Educación*, 18(3), 5-28. <https://doi.org/10.15366/reice2020.18.3.001>

- Bourdieu, P., & Wacquant, L. (2005). *Una invitación a la sociología reflexiva*. Siglo XXI Editores.
- Bowman, W. (2013). La educación musical en tiempos nihilistas. In D. K. Lines (Ed.), *La educación musical para el nuevo milenio* (pp. 49-69). Morata.
- Bowman, W. (2018). The social and ethical significance of music and music education. *Revista da Abem*, 26(40), 167-175. <https://doi.org/10.33054/abem2018a4010>
- Bresler, L., & Stake, R. (2006). Qualitative Research Methodology in Music Education. In R. Colwell (Ed.), *MENC handbook of research methodologies* (pp. 270-311). Oxford University Press.
- Cavieses-Fernández, E., & Apple, M. W. (2016). La ley docente y la clase media: controlando el desarrollo de los profesores chilenos. *Cadernos CEDES*, 36(100), 265-280. <https://doi.org/10.1590/cc0101-32622016171391>
- Day, C. (2014). *Pasión por enseñar: la identidad personal y profesional del docente y sus valores*. Narcea Ediciones.
- Díez-Gutiérrez, E. J. (2020). La gobernanza híbrida neoliberal en la educación pública. *Revista Iberoamericana de Educación*, 83(1), 13-29. <https://doi.org/10.35362/rie8313817>
- Diker, G., & Terigi, F. (1997). *La formación de maestros y profesores: hoja de ruta*. Paidós.
- Flick, U. (2016). *Qualitative Sozialforschung. Eine Einführung*. Rowohlt Taschenbuch Verlag.
- Freire, P. (2010). *Cartas a quien pretende enseñar*. Siglo XXI Editores.
- Giddens, A. (1997). *Modernidad e identidad del yo. El yo y la sociedad en la época contemporánea*. Ediciones Península.
- Giroux, H. (1997a). *Cruzando límites: Trabajadores culturales y políticas educativas*. Paidós.
- Giroux, H. (1997b). *Los profesores como intelectuales: hacia una pedagogía crítica del aprendizaje*. Paidós Ibérica.
- Iglesias, P., & Rivera, L. (2021). Migración forzada de clases a formato online: un estudio de caso en la formación del profesorado de Música en el contexto COVID-19. *Revista Electrónica de LEEME*, 19(48), 175-192. <https://doi.org/10.7203/LEEME.48.21700>
- Janesick, V. J. (2003). *Curriculum trends: A reference handbook*. ABC-CLIO.
- Jorgensen, E. R. (2003). *Transforming music education*. Indiana University Press.
- Jorquera, M. C. (2004). Métodos históricos o activos en educación musical. *Revista Electrónica de LEEME*, 14, 1-55. <https://ojs.uv.es/index.php/LEEME/article/view/9751>
- Kirkman, P., & Brownhill, S. (2020). Refining professional knowing as a creative practice: towards a framework for Self-Reflective Shapes and a novel approach to reflection. *Reflective Practice*, 21(1), 94-109. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2020.1712195>
- Kuhn, T. (1977). *The Essential Tension. Selected Studies in Scientific Tradition and Change*. The University of Chicago Press. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2504757>
- Laval, C. (2004). *La escuela no es una empresa: el ataque neoliberal a la enseñanza pública*. Paidós.
- Liston, D., & Zeichner, K. (1997). *Formación del profesorado y condiciones sociales de la escolarización*. Morata.
- Maykut, P., & Morehouse, R. (2002). *Beginning qualitative research: A philosophical and practical guide*. Routledge.
- MINEDUC (2008). *Marco para la buena enseñanza*. <https://www.cpeip.cl/marco-buena-ensenanza/>
- MINEDUC (2014). *Estándares orientadores para carreras de pedagogía en artes visuales y música*. https://www.cpeip.cl/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Estandares_artes_musicales_y_visuales_07-10.pdf
- Nettl, B. (1995). *Heartland excursions: Ethnomusicological reflections on schools of music*. University of Illinois Press.
- Nierman, G. E., Zeichner, K., & Hobbel, N. (2002). Changing Concepts of Teacher Education. In R. Colwell and C. Richardson (Eds.), *The new handbook of research on music teaching and learning: a project of the music educators national conference* (pp. 818-839). Oxford University Press.
- Núñez, P. (1960). Educación musical en los liceos. *Revista Musical Chilena*, 14(70), 36-40. <https://revistamusicalchilena.uchile.cl/index.php/RMCH/article/view/13076/13356>
- Núñez, I. (2007). La profesión docente en Chile: saberes e identidades en su historia. *Revista Pensamiento Educativo*, 41(2), 149-164. <https://pensamientoeducativo.uc.cl/index.php/pel/article/view/421>
- Peña, T., & Pirela, J. (2007). La complejidad del análisis documental. *Información, Cultura y Sociedad*, 16, 55-81. <https://doi.org/10.34096/ics.i16.869>
- Périsset, D. (2018). Construcción de la identidad profesional a través de la formación. Planes de estudio y proyecto político, una relación social estrecha. In I. Cantón & M. Tardif (Eds.), *Identidad profesional docente* (pp. 199-210). Narcea Ediciones. <https://doi.org/10.14201/teri.19665>
- Pino, Ó. (2015). *El concepto de música en el currículo escolar chileno 1810-2010* (Trabajo final de Máster). Universidad de Chile. <http://repositorio.uchile.cl/handle/2250/142566>
- Poblete, C. (2016). Formación de profesores de música en la Universidad de Chile: génesis y evolución de un modelo. En *Reconstruyendo la mirada: investigación en educación artística en la Universidad de Chile* (pp. 187-203). Facultad de Artes, Universidad de Chile.
- Poblete, C. (2017). Formación docente en Música en Chile: una aproximación histórica desde tres universidades. *Revista FAEEBA*, 26(48), 97-109. <https://doi.org/10.21879/faeeba2358-0194.2017.v26.n48.p97-109>
- Regelski, T. (2016). Music, Music education, and Institutional Ideology: A Praxial Philosophy of Musical Sociality. *Action, Criticism & Theory for Music Education*, 15(2), 10-45. http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Regelski15_2.pdf
- Sachs, J. (2005). Teacher Professional Standards: A Policy Strategy to Control, Regulate or Enhance the Teaching Profession? In N. Bascia, A. Cumming, A. Datnow, K. Leithwood, and D. Livingstone (Eds.), *International Handbook of Educational Policy* (pp. 579-592). Springer.
- Scheib, J. W. (2006). Tension in the Life of the School Music Teacher: A Conflict of Ideologies. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education*, 24(2), 5-13. <https://doi.org/10.1177/87551233060240020101>
- Serrano, R., Zamorano-Valenzuela, F. J., & González-Martín, C. (2020). El Máster en Formación del Profesorado de Música en Educación Secundaria y Bachillerato: análisis de los planes de estudio desde la perspectiva de la sociedad y economía del conocimiento. *Revista Electrónica de LEEME*, 46, 187-207. <https://doi.org/10.7203/LEEME.46.17600>

- Shifres, F., & Rosabal-Coto, G. (2017). Hacia una educación musical decolonial en y desde Latinoamérica. *Revista Internacional de Educación Musical*, 5, 85-91. <https://doi.org/10.12967/RIEM-2017-5-p085-091>
- Silva-Peña, I., & Peña-Sandoval, C. (2019). Desregulación de la formación inicial docente. Una experiencia neoliberal. *Revista Historia de la Educación Latinoamericana*, 21(32), 137-154. <https://doi.org/10.19053/01227238.8724>
- Simons, H. (2011). *El estudio de caso: Teoría y práctica*. Morata.
- Stake, R. (2006). *Multiple Case Study Analysis*. The Guilford Press.
- Stuhr, P. (1994). Multicultural Art Education and Social Reconstruction. *Studies in Art Education*, 35(3), 171-178. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1320218>
- Tezanos, A. de (2012). ¿Identidad y/o tradición docente? Apuntes para una discusión. *Perspectiva Educativa, Formación de Profesores*, 51(1), 1-28. <https://www.redalyc.org/comocitar.oi?id=333328167002>
- Uribe, C. (2019). La música en los ritos escolares. De la simpleza de los cantos a la instalación de una visión de mundo. En M. A. Ordás, M. Tanco, y I. C. Martínez (Eds.), *Investigando la experiencia, la producción y el pensamiento acerca de la música. Actas de las Jornadas de Investigación en Música* (pp. 152-158). Laboratorio para el Estudio de la Experiencia Musical (LEEM), Facultad de Bellas Artes, Universidad Nacional de La Plata.
- Valles, M. (1999). *Técnicas cualitativas de investigación social. Reflexión metodológica y práctica profesional*. Síntesis.
- Varkøy, Ø. (2007). Instrumentalism in the Field of Music Education: Are We All Humanists? *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 15(1), 37-52. <https://doi.org/10.2979/pme.2007.15.1.37>
- Willis, P. (2017). *Aprendiendo a trabajar. Como los chicos de la clase obrera consiguen trabajos de clase obrera*. Ediciones Akal.
- Yin, R. K. (1981). The Case Study as a Serious Research Strategy. *Science Communication*, 3(1), 97-114. <https://doi.org/10.1177/107554708100300106>
- Zeichner, K., & Liston, D. (1990). Traditions of Reform in U.S. Teacher Education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 41(2), 3-20. <https://doi.org/10.1177/002248719004100202>
- Zamorano-Valenzuela, F. J. (2020). Moviéndose en los márgenes: un estudio de caso sobre la identidad activista en la formación del profesorado de Música en Chile. *Revista Electrónica de LEEME*, 46, 127-142. <https://doi.org/10.7203/LEEME.46.16278>
- Zamorano-Valenzuela, F. J. (2021). La construcción de la identidad docente del profesorado de música en Chile: estudios de caso en las modalidades concurrente y consecutiva [Tesis doctoral, Universidad de Granada]. Repositorio institucional de la Universidad de Granada <http://hdl.handle.net/10481/71165>