Towards a bibliotextual edition of W.H. Auden's "In Time of War" (1973)

Ana GIMENO SANZ
Universidad Politécnica de Valencia.

ABSTRACT

The intention of this article is to claim bibliotextual criticism as the starting point in any process of editing texts, and to claim the need of carrying out a textual analysis before editing the poetry of W.H. Auden. This need is due to the fact that much of Auden's work, and specially that published during the nineteen thirties, has been repeatedly subject to various revisions by the author, thus presenting the reader with different versions of a single poem. Obviously, this is in itself a creative technique put into practice by Auden to improve the poetry written earlier in his life, but at the same time it is my belief that a critical approach to Auden's poetry must not reject any previously published versions that might exist of a particular poem, as the comparison of the different versions will undoubtedly enable us to better understand the author's creative mind and his changing ideas on poetical theory. To conclude, I aim to prove the need of preparing the grounds to establish an authoritative text or edition, which takes textual, stylistic, ideological, aesthetic, etc. elements into account, before proceeding to analyse a given text in any way. The text I have chosen to apply this theory to is "In Time of War" (1973).

In order to understand the bibliotextual process undertaken by "In Time of War" I shall begin by describing "Sonnets from China", a group of poems included in Edward Mendelson's edition of Auden's *Collected Poems* (1976), and then draw our attention to the connection between the two texts.

"Sonnets from China", a sequence of twenty one sonnets, comprises reflections on the human condition and on the role of an artist in time of

war. The first three sonnets constitute a prologue on the evolution of human consciousness. The next seven, a retrospect view of human history markedly anti-Romantic, combine the evocation of a series of historical epochs with portraits of personified types who supplied successive ages with models of heroic personality: the agriculturalist, the warrior, the prophet, the poet, the creator of cities, and so on. There follows a group of sonnets dealing directly with scenes from the war, with individual sonnets devoted to the dead, the wounded, air-raids, diplomats exchanging views, etc. The three final sonnets justify the work of artists and also of ordinary people who live simple, creative lives even in the face of apparent defeat by an all-powerful tyranny.

Returning to the *Collected Poems*, published in 1976, E. Mendelson opens his preface saying that "this edition includes all the poems that W.H. Auden wished to preserve, in a text that represents his final revisions. It thus omits the poems Auden published in his early years but finally discarded", therefore, it follows that Auden was satisfied with the substance of "Sonnets from China". Mendelson also lists, in one of his appendices, the titles of poems excluded from his edition and states:

Journey to a War (1939), containing 'In Time of War: A Sonnet Sequence with a Verse Commentary'. Reprinted in The Collected Poetry of W.H. Auden (1945) and Collected Shorter Poems 1930-1944 (1950); Collected Shorter Poems, 1927-1957, and the present edition, omit sonnets IX, X, XIV, XV, XX, XXVI, and the Verse Commentary, and severely revise the remainder as 'Sonnets from China'.

This leads us to discover that the antecedent of "Sonnets from China" is, therefore, to be found in the sequence "In Time of War" included in the travel book Journey to a War, written by Auden in collaboration with Christopher Isherwood, and published in 1939. This, of course, takes us to Journey to a War to verify what Mendelson means by "severely revised", but one inevitably comes across the "revised edition of Journey to a War, first published in 1973 and reprinted in 1986." We then discover that in the 1973 edition we have before us the contents of the sequence previously published as "Sonnets from China", under the original title, "In Time of War", as published in 1939, but with a major difference: the sequence has been reduced to twenty sonnets, since Sonnet XXI, dedicated to E.M. Forster, has become the opening poem to the whole book as originally in the 1939 edition.

Knowing, obviously, that it is inherent to poetry writing to revise, change and alter, it is nevertheless necessary to point out what the author himself has to say about his revisions. Auden refers to his revisions, in the 1973 edition of *Journey to a War*, as a process towards perfection not so much in terms of sense as of form:

When, after an interval of many years, I first re-read the sonnets in this book, I was very shocked to discover how carelessly I had written them. At the same time, their substance seemed to me to be worth salvaging, so I set to work. I have never revised earlier work so extensively as I have revised these poems and I hope I shall never have to again.

The "interval of years" referred to by Auden here is probably a period of 27 years—from 1939 to 1966—; the course of time between the first edition of Journey to a War—which included "In Time of War"—, and the first time the revised version, "Sonnets from China", appeared. "Sonnets from China", the sequence of twenty one sonnets, first appeared in the volume Auden assembled in 1965 and published in 1966 under the title Collected Shorter Poems, 1927-1957. "Sonnets from China", therefore, constitutes an intermediate stage between "In Time of War" (1939) and "In Time of War" (1973). The sonnets referred to by Auden as "carelessly written" are, undoubtedly, the original twenty seven sonnets which he later transformed into a sequence of twenty one, omitting six, and severely revised.

Although Journey to a War (1939) has been out of print now for a number of years—since 1943, according to Bloomfield and Mendelson (1972: 39-40)—, the 1939 version of "In Time of War" can be found in E. Mendelson's The English Auden (1977)—which compiles the poems Auden wrote between 1927 and 1939—; and also in his W.H. Auden: Selected Poems (1979). There is a difference, however, between the texts printed in these two books; the former includes both the dedicatory sonnet "To E.M. Forster"—as it appeared in Journey to a War—and the "Verse Commentary" under the title "In Time of War", whereas the latter only contains the actual twenty seven sonnet sequence. The sequence does not vary in substance to that already described before as "Sonnets from China" but there do exist major formal variations between "In Time of War" (1939) and "Sonnets from China" (1966), which I shall briefly describe below.

Having compared both texts—"In Time of War" (1939) and "Sonnets from China"— and taken note of all the textual alterations carried out by the author, the appendices in Mendelson's *The English Auden*—containing "In Time of War" (1939)—, throw further light on the bibliotextual process undertaken by the sequence when one reads:

The dedicatory poem is that used for *Journey to a War*. The date of the sequence is uncertain. Sonnet XII was written probably in 1936 when it was first published; XVIII was written in China in April 1938; the remaining sonnets were probably written in the late Summer and Autumn of 1938. The first half of the sequence was complete by September 1938, the second half and the Commentary by November. Some of the contents were shuffled in composition: in *The New Republic*, 7 December 1938, Auden published five sonnets of which two survived to the final version only in fragments.

The amount of information condensed into this one paragraph makes it necessary to closely examine its contents in order to discover the exact stages and transformations these sonnets were subject to and which led Auden to consider "In Time of War" (1973) the final result, or in other words, the last stage towards achieving a text with which he felt totally satisfied both in form and in substance.

The first thing one has to consider is that we are dealing with a sequence of sonnets which has "taken" a period of 37 years to become fully accomplished: the earliest date being 1936, date in which Mendelson points out that Sonnet XII (1939) was first published, and 1973 when the revised and final edition of "In Time of War" appeared. The 1973 edition, as we shall later see, was preceded by intermediate versions, a fact which enables me to say at this point that we have enough evidence, although none other than a sequence of 21 / 27 sonnets has been mentioned, to analyse the poetical evolution and also the methods of composition developed by an author who became one of the major influences on British and even foreign poetry in the nineteen thirties and after.

I would now like to complete the information given by Mendelson in his appendix. Sonnet XII (1939) was, in actual fact, published in 1936 under the title "The Economic Man" in New Verse. As can be seen in the Appendix a version of this sonnet also appeared in the book titled Some Poems (1940) and yet another version appeared in 1958, under the title "A New Age", in W.H. Auden: A Selection by the Author. Each one of these publications contains a different version of the sonnet whereby we can see how an original idea —a compound of 14 lines— has through the years, or should I say through its textual stages, been developed into five different sonnets with a common core. Not all the sonnets, of course, that later became "In Time of War" had been previously published and not all appeared in collections between the years 1939 and 1966.

"The Economic Man" (1936), though later a part of a sequence of sonnets theoretically written by Auden during his and Isherwood's visit to China, or rather during their journey to a war, had been germinated two or three years previous to that journey. It was in the summer of 1937, when Auden and Isherwood were commissioned by Messers. Faber and Faber of London and by Random House of New York to write a travel book about the East. The outbreak of the Sino-Japanese war decided them to go to China and the whole journey took place from January 1938 to the end of July of the same year. The result of this journey was the travel book Journey to a War (1939).

I have also been able to verify that five other sonnets had been published in periodicals prior to the journey and, therefore, prior to March 1939 when Journey to a War was published. These are: 1) "Press Conference", published in New Republic (1938), which later became Sonnet XIII in "In Time of War"; 2) "Air Raid", published in New Republic (1938), which later became Sonnet XIV in "In Time of War"; 3) "Chinese Soldier", published

in New Statesman and Nation (1938), which later became Sonnet XVIII in "In Time of War"; 4) "Exiles", published in New Writing (1938), which later became Sonnet XXI in "In Time of War"; and "Sonnet", in The Listener (1938), which later became Sonnet XXVII in "In Time of War".

Sonnet XI (1939) was also several times revised until finally becoming Sonnet IX in "Sonnets from China". Its intermediate versions were: "Ganymede", published in April 1939, in *Common Sense*; a version which appeared in *Some Poems* in 1940 under no title; and yet another, again under the title "Ganymede", in W.H. Auden: A Selection by the Author in 1958.

This last selection of poems assembled by Auden and published in 1958 included five of the sonnets whose antecedent is found in "In Time of War" (1939), two of which I have already referred to, and the following: "The Bard" (Sonnet V, 1939); "Surgical Ward" (Sonnet XVII, 1939); and "Embassy" (Sonnet XIX, 1939).

For the moment I have only spoken of the individual sonnets which can be considered as the intermediate stages between "Sonnets from China" / "In Time of War" (1973) and the 1939 text, but I must also mention that there followed, after 1939, several collections of poems which included either the 1939 version of "In Time of War" or "Sonnets from China". These, of course, also constitute independent textual stages as we shall now see.

Journey to a War was followed in 1945 by Auden's first collection of poems published in the United States under the title The Collected Poetry of W.H. Auden, and his second collection—known as the British version of the former—appeared five years later, in 1950, under the title Collected Shorter Poems 1930-1944. Both collections include the entire 27 sonnet sequence "In Time of War" (1939), but however a revised version of the "Verse Commentary". J.W. Beach has pointed out, in his book The Making of the Auden Canon (1975: 211), that, after thoroughly comparing both collections, there are only three variants between The Collected Poetry of W.H. Auden and Collected Shorter Poems 1930-1944. Two of which refer to the text we are dealing with:

In Sonnet XXII, 'In Time of War', 1945, and *Journey to a War* both have the correct French 'Il y a de la joie'; where 1950 has the defective 'Il y de la joie'. Sonnet XIII, 1950, has 'mourning' in the phrase 'the morning's injured weeping'.

In my opinion both are mere errata introduced in the 1950 edition, and not, obviously, variants introduced by the author.

When claiming it is possible to trace the poetic evolution or turn of Auden's creative work —from the germination to what the author will consider to be the final result of a text— by means of analysing the bibliotextual overhaul, all the alterations introduced by the author during the creative process should be carefully examined, taking into account the

various reasons —whether ideological or creative— which may have led him to introduce the variants. At this stage however I shall merely point out a few examples bearing in mind that each intermediate version between the 1939 and 1973 editions of "In Time of War" constitutes a beginning and an end in itself and we must never feel tempted to discard any of the sonnets merely because it is followed in time by a different version.

Auden's third collection of poems appeared in 1966 under the title Collected Shorter Poems, 1927-1957. As I have mentioned above, it included, for the first time, the sequence "Sonnets from China", identical in form to "In Time of War" (1973), and which is, according to the author himself, the final revised version. It also excluded the complete "Verse Commentary" originally included in "In Time of War" (1939). Besides omitting seven sonnets—IX, X, XIV, XV, XX, XXV and XXVI— the order of the rest of the 20 sonnets is also altered from Sonnet X11 onwards. Referring to "In Time of War" (1939), E. Mendelson points out in his book Early Auden: "The architecture is different in the 1965 revision, which is retitled 'Sonnets from China'." Auden, certainly changes the architecture of the sonnets which are to become "Sonnets from China", introducing significant alterations and variants both in form and in substance.

There shortly followed Selected Poems, published in 1968, in which "Sonnets from China" is reprinted in its total form, and then Collected Poems, published in 1976, also including "Sonnets from China". The latter was edited by E. Mendelson who points out in his preface: "This edition includes all the poems W.H. Auden wished to preserve, in a text that represents his final revisions." This collection does in fact include all the poems Auden wished to preserve but I think it would be more honest to consider "In Time of War" (1973) as the definitive text since, although it was published after "Sonnets from China" had already been included in several collections, Auden decides to return to the original title "In Time of War" and publish the sequence as part of a travel book as it originally appeared 34 years before, in 1939.

The substance of "Sonnets from China", does not altogether vary —as I have pointed out—compared to that of "In Time of War" (1939) but we must bear in mind, however, that after a period of 27 years—1939-1966—Auden takes "In Time of War" and introduces formal alterations which certainly help us understand the process of his poetic evolution and manner of conceiving poetry. We could even say that both in form and in substance the sonnets in this sequence signal a change in Auden's outlook.

Nevertheless, Auden himself points out in his "Foreword" to the Collected Shorter Poems, 1927-1957 that these alterations, in spite of what critics normally state, are not due to an ideological change: "I can only say that I have never, consciously at any rate, attempted to revise my former thoughts or feelings," stating that his true intention was: "To revise the language in which they were first exposed."

The sort of revisions referred to are however of various types. From an

overall point of view if we compare the editions mentioned earlier we find that the sonnets frequently lose or gain stanzas between first appearance in a periodical and first book publication, then undergo further transformations before being collected, or banished, or set in the larger context of a longer poem. But a close look at the sonnets reveals that Auden alters his poems in the course of time to serve his changing poetical and ethical standards, or to make what was ephemeral and local in reference more widely comprehensible. This is perfectly constant with Auden's earlier aesthetic principles and practice and it leads us to consider "In Time of War" (1973) as a product of an aesthetic and an ethic that has changed in time. Applying Barbara Everett's point of view we could say that:

Auden has reached a point of rest ["Sonnets from China", 1966] at which the definite form of the earlier work ["In Time of War", 1939] can be issued. He utilizes two opposing principles which can find their validation in the Christian definition of time—that time is real, but that 'Time must have a stop,' Auden offers a final and stabilized edition of a view of life strongly conditioned by the temporal.

Auden himself (1966: 16) gives us precise reasons as to why these revisions were, to his understanding, necessary. These observations refer to specific details:

Re-reading my poems, I find that in the nineteen-thirties I fell into some slovenly verbal habits. The definite article is always a headache to any poet writing in English, but my addiction to German usages became a disease. Again, it makes me wince when I see how ready I was to treat —or and —ow as homophones [...] I also find that my ear will no longer tolerate rhiming a voiced s with an unvoiced. I have had to leave a few such rhymes because I cannot at the moment see a way to get rid of them, but I promise not to do it again.

We should now have a look at one of the examples. I have chosen Sonnet XI from "Sonnets from China" whose antecedents are Sonnet XIII from "In Time of War" (1939) and "Press Conference" published in New Republic in 1938:

"Press Conference" (New Republic, 7 Dec. 1938)

Officials are always glad to give you information: We smoke their cigarettes and wonder what they cost; We're among friends, and warm; tea keeps away the frost; The dead are news, and news a social occupation.

Oh lies are sometimes noble but each glib evasion Seems only to confirm the Yellow River crossed; And there are truths too gross for cakes and explanation, Teruel fallen, gay Austria in a week-end lost. Are there the truly human, or the just, or strong? Not in this room, this world. *Our small star warms to birth*' Lives that will never grow. Snow whirls down from the North;

The quick new West is false; and prodigious but wrong This passive flowerlike people who for so long In the Eighteen Provinces have constructed the earth.

XIII ("In Time of War", 1939)

Certainly praise: let the song mount again and again For life as it blossoms out in a jar or a face. For the vegetable patience, the animal grace; Some people have been happy; there have been great men.

But hear the morning's injured weeping, and know why: Cities and men have fallen: the will of the Unjust Has never lost its power; still, all princes must Employ the Fairly-Noble unifying Lie.

History opposes its grief to our buoyant song: The Good Place has not been; our star has warmed to birth A race of promise that has never proved its worth;

The quick new West is false; and prodigious, but wrong This passive flower-like people who for so long In the Eighteen Provinces have constructed the earth.

XI ("Sonnets from China", 1966)

Certainly praise: let song mount again and again For life as it blossoms out in a jar or a face. For vegetal patience, for animal courage and grace: Some have been happy; some, even, were great men.

But hear the morning's injured weeping and know why: Ramparts and souls have fallen; the will of the unjust Has never lacked an engine; still all princes must Employ the fairly-noble unifying lie.

History opposes its grief to our buoyant song, To our hope its warning. One star has warmed to birth One puzzled species that has yet to prove its worth:

The quick new West is false, and prodigious but wrong The flower-like Hundred Families who for so long In the Eighteen Provinces have modified the earth.

The variations can be observed at first sight. With regard to "Press Conference", the last triplet and the second hemistich in line 10 are practically identical to the 1939 / 1966 versions. The following table will help us visualize the changes:

Line	1966 / 1973	1939
1.	song	the song
3.	vegetal]	the vegetable
	for grace:]	the animal grace;
4.	Some]	Some people
	some, even, were]	there have been
5.	weeping]	weeping:
6.	Ramparts and souls]	Cities and men
	unjust]	Unjust
7.	Has engine:	Has never lost its power;
	still]	still,
8.	fairly-noble]	Fairly-Noble
	lie	Lie
9.	song,]	song:
10.	To warning.]	The Good Place has not been;
	One birth	Our small star warms to birth New Republic
	One]	our
11.	One worth:]	A race of promise that has never proved its worth;
12.	false,]	false;
	prodigious]	prodigious,
13.	The Families]	The passive flowerlike people New Republic
		This passive flower-like people
14.	modified]	constructed

Sonnet XIII (1939), which falls at the centre of "In Time of War", is the key to the sequence: a finale to the first movement, the parable of man's history to this moment. It is an appeal to understanding and compassion and the moral condition of man that it describes underlies all aggressions of men against men, not any one in particular. E. Mendelson (Early Auden, 351), points out that Auden achieves "the double tone of celebration and reproach that will be the characteristic note of his later work. [...] Certainly praise: the emphasis of the opening intimates the qualifying But that will soon follow. The poet's task is both to speak and to hear, to celebrate and to understand. [...] And this double obligation has brought him to China's 'Eighteen Provinces,' to this war and this morning's injured." The same applies to Sonnet XI (1966), although the subtle variations convey a more mature approach in the later version.

Where possible I shall avoid giving my own interpretation of why the alterations were introduced, but refer to the reasons which Auden himself supplies us with. Firstly, the definite article "the" disappears when he rejects his "addiction to German usages" as I have mentioned above, thus creating a parallel between lines 2 and 3 (1966) while also adding the noun courage to complete the rhythm and image. In line 4 Auden also decides on a parallel structure by suppressing people and adding some in the second hemistich, but he is also less explicit: whereas greatness brings happiness in the first

version, greatness does not relate to happiness in the second. In line 6 cities and men become the more abstract and metaphorically rich ramparts and souls, which also allows the poet to drift away from evidence as he characteristically does in his later work. Four words lose their capitalized emphasis: *Unjust, Fairly-Noble* and *Lie*, following another habit the poet later decides to systematically eliminate. Line 7 is another example of how Auden feels less committed in 1966 and, from a more distant view, changes power for engine, implying the same idea but with a wider visual range. H. Carpenter (1981: 241) points out, referring to the 1939 sequence, that "History (in the sonnets) is seen as a failure to achieve 'The Good Place'. The war in China, to which the second part of the sequence turns, is shown to be a product of this universal human failure." The Good Place, referring to paradise, is a recurring concept in Auden's early poetry which, in the later version, is substituted by the more aesthetically perfect symmetrical pattern: grief/warning and buoyant song/hope. Man is optimistic by nature though history knows better and always reminds us of its wrongs. And optimism is also found in the more recent version of the sonnet in lines 11 and 12: our star (1966) suggests that several reasons (each and everyone's own star, including each individual's own existence) will prevent us from proving our worth, whereas One star (1939) implies that only one reason, beyond man's control, will prevent this, and therefore there is still hope that one day we shall be able to prove our worth. The last stanza maintains the tone of reproach in both versions although minor changes have also been introduced.

All this brings us back to claiming bibliotextual criticism as the starting point in any process of editing texts, and claiming the need of carrying out a textual analysis before editing the poetry of W.H. Auden. We are certainly familiar with the different editions of Shakespeare's plays, not to mention editions of Chaucer's or Milton's works among others. But whilst it is normal to edit classical works when we have several versions or no original manuscript at all —Shakespeare's Folios and Quartos would be a good example—, it is not so to edit a more recent text, for instance one written by a poet whose practice consists precisely —at least with regard to the text we are now dealing with— of introducing us to re-arranged and recomposed poems.

Confronted with writing a critical study, and wanting to talk about the sequence of sonnets entitled "In Time of War" included in Journey to a War, we would have to be very explicit in explaining that there exist two absolutely different texts under that same title. We would have to be very clear in referring to either of the editions, not to mention all those intermediate stages which have, after all, made it possible for the final product to exist. Also, Auden gives so much away —about himself, his political views, religious feelings, his way of interpreting the world, etc.—through his poems that the fact of constantly reworking them offers us an

enormous number of clues as to how all these features changed with experience and time. And lastly, for a person involved in the task of translating "Sonnets from China" into a foreign language, the fact of knowing that there are other versions of a sonnet may, in many instances, clarify the meaning of some obscure passage or give the translator an alternative without his deviating from the meaning. A good example which illustrates this process is the translation of "Sonnets from China" by J. V. Martínez Luciano.

APPENDIX

List of books which include either "In Time of War" (1939) / (1973) or "Sonnets from China":

Journey to a War, (1939)	«In Time of War» (1939)
Some Poems, (1940)	Version of Sonnet XI, «In Time of War» (1939)
	Version of Sonnet XII, «In Time of War» (1939)
The Collected Poetry of W.H. Auden, (1945)	«In Time of War» (1939)
Collected Shorter Poems, 1930-1944, (1950)	«In Time of War» (1939)
W.H. Auden: A Selection by the Author, (1958)	«The Bard»: Version of Sonnet VII, «In Time of War» (1939)
	«Ganymede»: Version of Sonnet XI, «In Time of War» (1939)
	«A New Age»: Version of Sonnet XII, «In Time of War» (1939)
	«Surgical Ward»: Version of Sonnet XVII, «In Time of War» (1939)
	«Embassy»: Version of Sonnet XIX, «In Time of War» (1939)
Collected Shorter Poems, 1927-1957, (1966)	«Sonnets from China»
Selected Poems, (1968)	«Sonnets from China»
Journey to a War, (1973)	«In Time of War» (1973)
Collected Poems, (1976)	«Sonnets from China»
Selected Poems, (1979)	«In Time of War» (1939)

NOTES

"Auden proposed a collection to his American publisher early in 1942, and delivered the manuscript at the end of the following year. Wartime delays permitted further additions and changes during 1944, and *The Collected Poetry of W.H. Auden* appeared at last in April 1945. A British version of the book titled *Collected Shorter Poems 1930-1944*, appeared in 1950." Mendelson, E. (ed.) (1976). W.H. Auden: Collected Poems, 11.

Mendelson, E. (1981). Early Auden, p. 349. Mendelson refers to the year 1965 because the "Foreword" in Collected Shorter Poems, 1927-1957 is signed by the author in 1965, although the book was published in 1966.

³ We have underlined the text which partly coincides with the two later versions.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Auden, W. H. (1966). Collected Shorter Poems, 1927-1957, London: Faber.

Auden, W. H. (1968). Selected Poems, London: Faber.

Auden, W. H., and Isherwood, C. (1939), Journey to a War, London: Faber.

Auden, W. H., and Isherwood, C. (1973). Journey to a War, London: Faber.

Beach, J. W. (1975). The Making of the Auden Canon, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Bloomfield, B. C., and Mendelson, E. (1972). W.H. Auden. A Bibliography, 1924-1969, Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia.

Carpenter, H. (1981). W. H. Auden: A Biography, London: George Allen and Unwin.

Everett, B. (1964). Auden, London: Oliver and Boyd.

Martínez Luciano, J. V. (1991). "Sonetos de China". La Página, vol. 4, La Laguna.

Mendelson, E. (ed.) (1976). W. H. Auden: Collected Poems, London: Faber.