Reseñas

Barcelona a Jaime I de Aragón -1131/1276-), S. FONTENLA BALLESTA ("Un hallazgo numismático en la "Huerta del Nublo" -Lorca, Murcia-") y J. RODRIGUES MARINHO ("As moedas dos Reinos de Taifas nas Coleções Portuguesas"). Se trata pues de importantes aportaciones sobre el monedaje de los Reinos de Taifas bajo la perspectiva de muy diversos enfoques, completadas por un variado e interesante plantel de Comunicaciones. Quince en total, en torno a tipologías, tesorillos y hallazgos de diferentes períodos del monedaje islámico andalusí, de las que cabe destacar los estudios sobre documentación monetal, por ser la primera vez que aparecen en estos encuentros numismáticos. La publicación finaliza, como es habitual, con el Programa de este II Jarique y su Relació d'assistents.

Por último, sólo cabe plantear un problema de inexactitud terminológica: la utilización de expresiones como "Taifas califales" o "Taifas almorávides", ya que semánticamente suponen una contradicción que no debería ser pasada por alto en los estudios numismáticos.

La presentación de las actas de este II Jarique tuvo lugar durante las jornadas del III Jarique de Numismática Hispano-Arabe que tuvo lugar en Madrid, del 13 al 16 de Diciembre de 1990 (Dpto. de Numismática y Medallística del Museo Arqueológico Nacional), cuyas actas, en principio, serán así mismo presentadas en 1993, fecha fijada para la celebración del próximo Jarique.

A. ARIZA ARMADA


The significance of a book is reason enough to review it even several years after its publication. Simply, W.'s study is an important contribution to a quite neglected period in the history of al-Andalus.

The book is divided into four sections: Part I consists of the introduction and a survey of the Caliphate of Cordoba up to the year of 399/1009. Part II, "The Taifa States", deals with the political history of Islamic Spain during the 11th century, identifying and characterizing most of the known petty states. Part III, "Taifa Society", studies the division of society into the three religious communities - the Muslims, Jews and Christians - and attempts to verify their respective positions. Part IV, "The Turning point", deals with the "reconquista" or the relations of the weakened Islamic states with the aggressive Christian states in the North of the peninsula.

To explain the sudden collapse of the unitarian state at the beginning of the 11th century, W. discusses the political roles played by members of military groups such as the "new" Berbers, Slavs and Andalusians (Arabs and long settled Berbers) in the struggle for caliphal powers in Cordoba from 1008 to 1031. In his competent account, W. mainly relies on chronicles compiled from original sources during the 13th century and later. To this reviewer, it is a pity that W. uses quotations from the Dajîrah of Ibn Bassâm (12th century) only sporadically, instead of making full use of this important anthology.

An extremely useful list of the 38 most important Ta‘ifâ kingdoms and their respective rulers is contained in the fourth chapter (pp. 83-98). Some of the petty states became independent when the governors of towns that were acting as military centers
seceded from the Cordoba central government during the turmoil of the year 399 (p. 106). Most of the other rulers, such as the Slavic dynasties on the East coast and the "new" Berber states in the South and Southwest, were founded by usurpers, who "had escaped the confused situation in the capital at this time" (p. 105). It is very interesting that all of these states, even the smaller ones, had a population from mixed ethnic origin (p. 106f.). Therefore, geographical factors rather than ethnic variables determined the character and political possibilities of these states. Sparsely populated areas, where agricultural production was difficult, produced larger states, e.g., the border states of Badajoz, Toledo and Zaragossa. Other areas with an intensive agriculture or other economic advantages, such as a favourable harbour, produced smaller states. This was the case with the tiny kingdoms in the East coast region. Geographical isolation was a catalyzing factor in creating small states in the mountainous South and at the Southwest coast.

Chapter 5 (pp. 116-155) deals with Tā'ifā politics and the various political actors involved. Although most Tā'ifā-rulers used sophisticated titles, ideology played only a minor role in the struggle for power (pp. 123-125). Political alliances were determined by political opportunism rather than ethnic solidarity. The military and economic weakness of most of these states was a main feature of Tā'ifā politics, resulting in a cautious policy of self-maintenance rather than expansion. The major exception was Sevilla, which followed an aggressive policy against its smaller neighbours. Most of them were incorporated into Sevillian territory in the second half of the century. W. argues against the attitude to consider Sevillian policy to be determined by "anti-Berber" feelings, since half of the dethroned rulers were no Berbers at all.

The section on internal politics (pp. 137-145) explains the pattern of government, which was monarchic in general with the masses enjoying no political representation. The local elite (Jāṣṣa) organized in a council of some sort (maṣyaja or simply maṣlīs) sometimes played an active role in choosing the rulers, but the quality of the political participation of the jāṣṣa remains obscure. W.'s concept of the faqīh (not faqīhs!) as a "sort of independent class in Andalusian society, broadly speaking on the edges of the jāṣṣa without always forming part of it" (p. 149) is extremely vague and needs further explanation. A faqīḥ is first of all a scholar (ālim) of religious law (fiqh) who by this quality belongs to the group of the 'ulamā‘. Within the 'ulamā‘ one finds people of very humble origin as well as members of powerful families like the Banū Yathwar or the Banū ‘Abbād. As indicated by a survey of the biographical dictionaries of the time, the occupation with fiqh was not exclusively in the hands of certain families, whereas the appointment to the office of qāḍī was usually limited to members of few influential families. The author did not realize that the 'ulamā‘, due to their social prestige as "learned scholars" of the religion, could have played an important role as intermediaries between the masses and the rulers.

This leads to the third section of the book, "Taifa Society", which reflects more than any other part of the book our gaps in knowing and understanding of which factors determined the political and social life in 11th century Islamic Spain.

Andalusian Muslims did not have a common ethnic background, but were either Arabs, long established Berbers, Mawallads or so-called "Slavs". All these groups were culturally Arabicised and most of them were exempt from military service. (p. 163) W. follows Lévi-Provençal in stating that there existed a strong Andalusian identity. Concerning Guichard's counterargument that due to the survival of "oriental" patrilineal structures no fusion of the Andalusian Arabs and Andalusian Berbers happened to take place, W. holds that there is no indication that a berber tribalism between "old" and
“new” Berbers was important in the 11th century. In this reviewer’s opinion, one cannot further proceed in this argumentation, unless the social and administrative context of Andalusian society will be analyzed.

In his chapter on Muslim religion the author accepts the unchallenged predominance of the Mālikī school of law, but, then concentrates on single persons adhering to the other three Sunnī schools of law. W. fails to take into consideration the dimension of a Mālikī-dominated Islam in the formation of patterns of urban life. Urvoy’s study Le monde des ulémas andalous is only cited in the context of cultural contacts inside the Islamic world as reflected by travelling scholars to and from al-Andalus. One can say that W. interest lies mainly in peripheral problems of the Muslim creed in al-Andalus, whereas the interaction of religious institutions and the importance of daily life completely escapes his attention. Therefore, his statement that there was "little evidence of any deep-seated alienation on the part of the mass of the population from their rulers" (p. 187) is not supported by evidence; at the same time, the assertion ignores the frequent uprisings of urban masses.

Whereas W. generalizes the situation of the Muslims, he goes into considerable detail in the more comprehensive chapter on the Jews of al-Andalus (26 pages on Muslims and Arabic culture, 33 on Jews and Jewish office-holders). The extensive use of Hebrew sources is laudable, but, taken the Jewish role within the context of Andalusian society as a whole, this chapter presents an unbalanced account.

The chapter on Christians (pp. 224-246) is lacking consistency. W. avoids the term "mōzarab" for them without telling his reasons. If we accept his statement that "Andalusian Christians did not share in the Arab-Islamic culture of the Muslims", we must come to the conclusion that these Christians obviously were very marginalized. This viewpoint would explain why neither the Christians in the North considered Andalusian Christians at that time to be potential allies, nor the Muslims used them as scapegoats (p. 224). W. rightly states the lack of information produced by Christians themselves during the 11th century in contrast to a rich documentation by the Christians in Christian Spain. He warns against over-interpretation of the statements by Christian powers on behalf of the mōzarabs, since these could reflect the political aims of the writers rather than the real situation in Islamic Spain. But W. himself is obviously falling into this trap. On the other hand, W. accepts the old thesis of a "cultural depression" of the Christians, which he does not confirm by evidence from the 11th century. (p. 234) He states the "absence of any works at all, whether in Latin or in Arabic, by Christians in al-Andalus in the fifth/eleventh century" (p. 238) and suggests that the cultural elite had converted to Islam and adopted the Arabic language together with Islamic Civilization in a process of acculturation.

The fourth part (pp. 249-296) of the book, entitled "the Turning Point", is divided into two chapters. The first deals with interior developments in the Christian states of the Northern part of Spain and their military acquisitions during the 11th century, while the second chapter shows some of the Muslims reactions to this new Christian threat. W. argues that Christian leaders only slowly perceived the chances of expanding power in view of the disintegration and weakening of Muslim authority in the first half of the century. Although most Tā'īfa-knigdoms paid heavy tribute (parias) to the Christians, it was not before the middle of the century that substantial territories were conquered by the Christians. A key issue in W’s argument is at what point the Christians realized that they would eventually drive the Muslims out of Spain. In this context W. considers a speech of Ferdinand of Galicia (1035-1065) at the beginning of his reign in response to a request for help from a Toledanian delegation, in which Ferdinand threatens the
Muslims to throw them out of Spain since "their time was fulfilled" (Bayan 3, 282) as a "serious policy of reconquest" (p. 264) and a "dramatically different response from the past" (p. 250). This is overstressing the point, since Ferdinand's first answer to the Toledan request for help was simply that he would grant it, but under very heavy conditions. Only when the Toledanians refused to meet his demands and said they would rather pay the Berbers if they had the money, (C.f. Bayan) Ferdinand responded in the manner mentioned above. It certainly was a new way in which the young king dealt with the Muslims, but not a programmatic speech for a "reconquista", a word that did not exist in 11th century Spanish language (p. 273). W. does not ask whether the people of the 11th century could predict the final expulsion of the Muslims - a question quite legitimate because the Muslims were still a formidable power until the middle of 13th century and the last Muslim state was conquered as late as 1492.

To the Muslims the temporary conquest of Barbastro (1064) and the fall of Toledo (1085) was a heavy blow, ending an attitude of "uncertainty, of accommodation and appeasement of their Christian neighbours" (p. 276). Public opinion recognized the imminent danger emerging from the Christian states and its threat to Islamic culture in general. The discontent with incompetent Ta' ifa-rulers vis-à-vis a religious enemy and the fall of Toledo pushed the north African Almoravids into action in Spain.(p. 288)

Taken as a whole, W.'s study is an important contribution to our knowledge of a period of history which is in many respects problematic. Yet, to understand the internal structure of Andalusian society, further efforts have to be made, by using not only chronological compilations, but all available sources.

C. MÜLLER


Interesante antología de textos sobre al-Andalus y en menor número sobre Sicilia musulmana, referidos a la época en que ambas inician y confirman su involución territorial, como acontecer trascendental y definitivo. Puesto que existió una cierta sincronización histórica entre ambas -subrayada por P. Guichard en su "introducción general"- la atención a esos dos espacios a la vez podría aportar datos comparativos de análisis sobre el derrotero de cada uno. Ahí está, en acción, la propuesta. A la vez queda de manifiesto la diferenciación de otros espacios islámicos medievales, incluso el próximo magrebí, que, evidentemente, tuvo otro desarrollo.

El libro se estructura en cinco partes: la primera es una exposición histórica del Islam occidental, en los dos siglos considerados, con remisión a los 53 grandes bloques de textos reunidos en las cuatro partes siguientes, tituladas "hombres y paisajes de Sicilia y al-Andalus", "las taifas andalusíes: fragmentación política y brillo cultural", "al-Andalus bajo el poder almorávide: endurecimiento de la tensión entre Islam y Cristianidad", y "el frágil apogeo del siglo XII: contradicciones político-ideológicas y aparente poderío del imperio almohade", terminando el libro con una selección de mapas.

Además de toda la información estricta que los textos, significativamente elegidos, aportan con sus reflexivas e informadas presentaciones, en toda su gama, desde crónicas a literatura, desde textos epigráficos a numismáticos, desde jurídicos a filosóficos, hay una sobrapeortación, y consiste en la prueba implícita a que son sometidos como focos de información, lo cual también se explicita en diversas ocasiones,