British men’s magazines’ scent advertising and the multimodal discursive construction of masculinity: a preliminary study

Eduardo de GREGORIO-GODEO

Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha
Departamento de Filología Moderna
Email: Eduardo.Gregorio@uclm.es

Recibido: 30-4-2008
Aceptado: 20-5-2009

ABSTRACT
This paper presents a preliminary study of the multimodal discourse on masculinity constituted in contemporary British men’s magazines’ perfume advertising pages. In particular, this contribution intends to delineate what might be taken to be appropriate research directions for further empirical investigations on the discursive construction of masculinity in a genre of multimodal nature where images feature more prominently than language. Through a methodological integration of Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) social semiotics framework and Fairclough’s (1995b) CDA methodology for the examination of media discourse, the present study aims to shape the hypothesis that the discursive construction of masculinity carried out in these perfume advertisements – embedded into the socio-cultural matrix accounting for its emergence – is multimodally articulated, thereby attempting to fix some analytical categories for any further empirical investigations necessary for providing specific results about the discursive construction of the masculine in this genre. In so doing, this piece does not claim any ‘results’ as such – which would have certainly demanded an examination of a wider corpus – but makes explicit certain hypotheses for further corpus-based research.

Keywords: discourse, masculinity, men’s magazines, multimodality, scent advertising.
discursiva de lo masculino en este género. Si pues, la presente contribución no aporta “resultados” como tales —lo cual hubiera requerido el examen de un corpus más amplio— sino que explícita ciertas hipótesis para investigaciones futuras basadas en un corpus más amplio.

**Palabras clave**: discurso, masculinidad, revistas masculinas, multimodalidad, anuncios de perfume.

**SUMARIO**: 1. Introduction. 2. Towards a multimodal conception of discourse. 3. British men’s magazines and advertising. 4. A methodology for the examination of multimodal discourse in print-media advertising. 5. A preliminary study of multimodal discourse design in men’s magazines’ scent advertising: the language and image interplay. 5.1. Discourse design. 5.1.1 Representations. 5.1.2 Negotiating identities and relations. 5.1.3. Attitudes. 5.1.4. Information value. 5.2. From discourse design to discourse production and consumption. 6. Conclusion: bridging the gap between multimodal discourse and contemporary masculine cultures in men’s magazines’ scent advertising.

### 1. INTRODUCTION

Men’s magazines have become a major arena for the representation of masculinity in contemporary Britain. As well as containing different features dealing with the assumed masculine lifestyle, advertising is crucial to these publications. In addition to high-tech, tobacco, menswear or grooming, male scent is an important area of advertising in men’s magazines, and contributes actively to the construction of discourses on masculinity articulated in popular-culture genres in the UK. In accordance with print-media forms of advertising, this discourse takes shape through a characteristic combination of language and images. In fact, “ads are multimodal, and can use pictures, music, and language, either singly or in combination, as the medium permits” (Cook 2001: 219). As Renkema puts it, “this mix of modes, which is nearly always present in communication, is called multimodality” (2004: 76).

This paper presents a preliminary study of the multimodal discourse on masculinity constituted in contemporary British men’s magazines’ perfume advertising pages. In particular, this contribution intends to delineate what might be taken to be appropriate research directions for further empirical investigations on the discursive construction of masculinity in a genre of multimodal nature where images feature more prominently than language. Through a methodological integration of Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) social semiotics framework and Fairclough’s (1995b) critical discourse analysis (henceforth CDA) methodology for the examination of media discourse, the present study aims to shape the hypothesis that the discursive construction of masculinity carried out in these perfume advertisements – embedded into the socio-cultural matrix accounting for its emergence – is multimodally articulated, thereby attempting to fix some analytical categories for any further empirical investigation necessary for providing specific

---

1 The author is most grateful to the referees of this contribution for their most accurate and illuminating comments, which have contributed to improving the paper in a substantial way.
results about the discursive construction of the masculine in this genre. In so doing, this piece does not claim any ‘results’ as such – which would have certainly demanded an examination of a wider corpus – but rather limits itself to making explicit the potential of integrative approaches combining social semiotics and CDA for the analysis of multimodal discourses incorporating language and image. On the whole, we are aware that, considering the programmatic character of this investigation, some of the analytical categories derived from such a methodological integration of social semiotics and CDA might not hold up to empirical testing. However, the preliminary study herein conducted sets out to constitute hypotheses contributing to articulating directions of research for broader corpus-based investigations.

2. TOWARDS A MULTIMODAL CONCEPTION OF DISCOURSE

The term *discourse* has come to be used with a multiplicity of meanings across the social sciences and the humanities. Following the fundamental impact of Michel Foucault and post-structuralism upon contemporary cultural and social theory, the notion of discourse has tended to be employed across the social sciences to delineate “ways of speaking about the world of social experience […] A discourse on this view is a means of both producing and organising meaning within a social context” (Edgar and Sedgwick 1999: 117). In Foucault’s pioneering view, discourses designate “the practices that systematically form the objects of which they speak” (1972: 49), which has led contemporary cultural theorists to conceptualise discourses – in rather abstract terms – as

ways of referring to or constructing knowledge about a particular topic of practice: a cluster (or formation) of ideas, images and practices, which provide ways of talking about, [and] forms of knowledge and conduct associated with, a particular topic, social activity or institutional site in society (Hall 1997a: 6).

In addition to the use of this notion within post-structuralist cultural theory, discourse has become an area of great interest in linguistics, where this term has traditionally been identified with any form of language above the sentence level (Stubbs 1983: 1), or any form of language in use (Brown and Yule 1983: 1). In more recent times discourse analysis, the discipline concerned with the examination of this notion within linguistics, has come to conceptualise discourses as forms of social practice where language features prominently, that is

---

2 For detailed overviews of the different meanings acquired by this notion, see Mills (1997), Howarth (2000) or Blommaert (2005).
a means of talking and writing about and acting upon worlds, a means which both constructs and is constructed by a set of social practices within these worlds, and in so doing both reproduces and constructs afresh particular social-discursive practices, constrained and encouraged in the overarching social formation (Candlin 1997: ix).

This conceptualisation of discourse as a form of social practice in the realm of discourse analysis – as a major area of linguistics – has been particularly notable within the field of critical linguistics/CDA (see reviews by Wodak 1995; Fairclough and Wodak 1997; van Dijk 2001; Wodak and Meyer 2001), which has produced what Mills has metaphorically labelled as a “fusion of linguistics and cultural theory” (1997: 10) when approaching this notion. In bridging the gap between linguistics and cultural theory, critical linguists have paid particular attention to the role of semiotic modes other than language in actively contributing to the configuration of discourses. Thus, in their examination of the agenda of CDA for the new millennium, Chouliaraki and Fairclough use the term discourse to refer to semiotic elements of social practices. Discourse therefore includes language (written and spoken and in combination with other semiotics, for example, with music in singing), nonverbal communication (facial expressions, body movements, gestures, etc.) and visual images (for instance, photographs, film) (1999: 38).

The assumption that language is not the only semiotic mode constituting discourses has become central to critical linguistics, which is the overall epistemological paradigm underlying the approach to multimodal discourse analysis (henceforth MMDA) in this article. Nonetheless, this idea has now become a basic tenet across discourse studies. As Jaworski and Coupland underline, discourse reaches out further than language itself. When we think of discourse in the wider context of communication, we can extend its analysis to include non-linguistic semiotic systems (systems for signalling meaning), those of non-verbal and non-vocal communication which accompany or replace speech or writing [

\[ \text{\textsuperscript{3}} \text{ As van Dijk puts it, critical linguistics and CDA may be best defined as “a shared perspective on doing linguistic, semiotic or discourse analysis” (1993: 131). Some linguists have made a difference between critical linguistics, that is, “a developing branch of linguistics which aims to reveal power relations and ideological processes at work in spoken or written texts” (Crystal 2003: 117), and CDA, namely “a perspective which studies the relationship between discourse events and cultural factors, especially the way discourse is ideologically influenced by and can influence power relations in society” (ibid, 117-118). However, for theorists and practitioners in the field like Wodak, “they can both be said to occupy the same ‘paradigmatic space’” (1995: 204).}

\[ \text{\textsuperscript{4}} \text{ Modes may be conceived of as different “means of communication” (Cook 2001: 42) or “semiotic systems” (Jaworski and Coupland 1999a: 7).} \]
non-verbal discourse modes include painting, sculpture, photography, design, music and film (1999a: 7).

At the turn of the millennium, the premise that discourses are often constituted on the basis of various modes interplaying with each other has taken shape under the notion of multimodal discourses (Kress and van Leeuwen 2001), where “common semiotic principles operate in and across different modes” (Kress and van Leeuwen 2001: 2) contributing to the articulation of specific discourses.

Today MMDA may be claimed to have grown into an independent field within the broader domain of discourse studies. As Renkema indicates, “in discourse studies the simultaneous use of modes was neglected a long time. […]. But the last few decades have seen so much mixture of modes, especially the visualization of communication that multimodality has become an important factor in discourse studies” (2004: 76). MMDA sometimes benefits from the theoretical origins of its practitioners, by way of example, critical linguistics (e.g. Kress and van Leeuwen 2001) or systemic-functional linguistics (e.g. O’Halloran 2004). In addition to proposing analytical perspectives for the examination of general communicative contexts where multimodality is relevant (e.g. Norris 2004; Ventola, Charles and Martin 2004; Baldry and Thibault 2005), MMDA has come to focus its attention on more specific areas, including those generated by ICT (LeVine and Scollon 2004; Odysseas 2005) or education (Baldry 2000; Kress, Jewitt, Ogborn and Charalampos 2001).

3. BRITISH MEN’S MAGAZINES AND ADVERTISING

Since they first appeared in the mid-eighties, men’s lifestyle magazines have become a well-established print-media market in the UK. Only a decade after they started being published, men’s general-interest magazines had become the fastest-growing magazine sector in Britain (cf. Smith 1996: 1-2). According to Jackson, Stevenson and Brooks (2001: 30), this tendency has continued to date, so that at the turn of the century many of these magazines were reaching a circulation of over 500,000 items per month. Sold on a monthly basis at two to three pounds, this print-media sector includes titles such as Arena, Esquire, FHM, Front, GQ, Loaded, Maxim, Men’s Health or Stuff for Men. Edwards has defined the ideal readers of these publications as “a quite specific and often fixed targeting of single, affluent, city-dwelling, high-earning and high-spending, primarily heterosexual

---

5 Jaworski and Coupland interestingly point out that early functional linguists like Halliday, and even Jakobson, already acknowledged that discourse – or rather language in use – is multiply structured, so that any “focus on multi-modal discourse is in one sense a continuation of this traditional view, especially when it can be shown that different semiotic resources or dimensions (e.g. visual images and linguistic text in a textbook) fulfil different communicative functions” (1999a: 8).
men to the exclusion of all others: that is, all those who do not at least primarily aspire to this way of living or its values” (1997: 76). As evidenced by Mort’s (1988: 211) and Smith’s (1996: 32) market research, these general-interest periodicals are targeted at a 25- to 35-year-old male reader.

As “an important site for the articulation of aspects of modern masculinity and addressal of the masculine consumer” (Benwell 2003a: 6), men’s magazines may be considered as a key arena for the construction and distribution of gendered discourses on masculinity in contemporary Britain. In addition to interviews with famous male icons and celebrities, these magazines incorporate various features to do with sport, health and fitness, sex and women, travel, art and male fashion. Advertising is vital for these publications, with lots of pages about tobacco, alcohol, technology, male clothing and accessories, and grooming. Together with other toiletries, male perfume is the object of many advertisements displayed in the pages of men’s magazines. As explored below, fragrances are advertised through a combination of short linguistic messages and visuals attempting to attract the attention of magazine readers, who are treated as potential purchasers.

4. A METHODOLOGY FOR THE EXAMINATION OF MULTIMODAL DISCOURSE IN PRINT-MEDIA ADVERTISING

In an attempt to examine the multimodal discourse on masculinity constructed in British men’s magazines’ perfume advertising pages, a methodological approach will be drawn upon integrating Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) social semiotics theory and Fairclough’s (1995b) CDA framework for the analysis of media discourse. This combined and integrative method has been selected taking into account the nature of the genre explored and the research goals of the preliminary study conducted in this paper. As it is, given that both approaches adopt the premise that there is a close connection between discourse behaviour and ideology, we assume the hypothesis that their combination is then plausible when attempting to explore how image/text combinations are contributing to the discursive construction of masculine identity in the U.K. via the vehicle of advertisements in men’s magazines.

Firstly, the choice of social semiotics has been made considering the nature of the genre herein analysed, which combines image and language with a preponderance of the former: “perfume ads are ticklers with very short copy (typically under ten words, sometimes with no more than the brand name itself)” (Cook 2001: 106). As defined by Fairclough and Wodak, “social semiotics draws attention to the multi-semiotic character of most texts in contemporary society, and explores ways of analysing visual images (from press photographs and television images to Renaissance art) and the relationship between language and visual images” (1997: 164). Within the broader field of discourse studies (for overviews of the discipline see Jaworski and Coupland 1999b; Schiffrin, Tannen and
Hamilton 2001), social semiotics may be located as a major tradition of CDA/critical linguistics, a domain specialised in unveiling the relations between power, ideology, language and other non-linguistic semiotic modes in society. Work by van Leeuwen (1987, 2005), Hodge and Kress (1988), Kress and van Leeuwen (1996) or Thibault (1991) has been highly influential in shaping social semiotics into frameworks for the analysis of images and their interplay with language in various genres6. Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) Reading Images is used in this study, given the authors’ analysis of images based on a linguistic approach which is most relevant for the examination of the multimedia genre analysed here.

Secondly, contrary to other CDA approaches more focused on textual analysis per se, since his early work Fairclough (1989, 1992, 1995a) has used CDA to investigate questions of socio-cultural change and change in discourse – and how discourse constructs and reflects identities and social relations – through a multi-layered conception of discourse where textual features are embedded into further socio-cultural practices via mediated processes of textual production and interpretation by individuals who come to use different genres in the course of their social interactions. In his work Media Discourse – drawn upon here – Fairclough (1995b) adapts this overall CDA framework to the analysis of media discourse in particular, and lays a stronger emphasis on image analyses than in his earlier work.

Thirdly, both social semiotics and Fairclough’s CDA are part of the same critical-linguistics epistemological tradition and are accordingly based on common theoretical premises (cf. Wodak 1995), which makes them highly compatible with one another from a methodological perspective. The linguistic approach that Kress and van Leeuwen (1996) devise for the analysis of images is modelled on the systemic-functional approach, and Fairclough (1995b: 17, 58) also acknowledges his use of “a ‘multifunctional’ view of texts, drawn from the ‘systemic’ theory of language”. Moreover, in considering that “a discourse refers to the process of semiosis rather than its product (i.e. text) [and] it is always realized through texts” (Hodge and Kress 1988: 264), social semiotics has succeeded in reading images as texts, but has not been concerned with disentangling the socio-cultural matrix of such discourses in so much detail as CDA has. However, Kress and van Leeuwen (1996) provide a more elaborate framework for the textual reading of images than Fairclough (1995b), who, in his theorization of CDA, similarly acknowledges that “texts do not need to be linguistic at all; any cultural artefact – a picture, a building, a piece of music – can be seen as a text” (Fairclough 1995a: 4).

In his analytical framework for media discourse, Fairclough (1995b: 201-205 and passim) recommends paying attention to a number of variables including:

---

6 Burn and Parker (2003: 5) go so far as to say that “multimodality is rooted in social semiotics (Hodge and Kress 1988), a theory of sign-making which sees all acts of communication as social”.
(1) **How is the text designed?** This analytical variable includes the analysis of (a) intertextuality – if at all relevant – and (b) language, focusing on the role of language in constructing (i) representations (e.g. lexical choices, processes and participants, presuppositions, voices, given and new information, etc.); (ii) relations and identities (i.e. relations between media personnel and audiences or readers through register, key, modality, etc.); and (iii) how language interplays with images.

(2) **How are texts of this sort produced, and in what ways are they likely to be interpreted and used?** The focus here is on any ideologically salient processes of textual production, interpretation, distribution and consumption.

(3) **What does the text indicate about the media order of discourse?**

(4) **What wider socio-cultural processes is this text a part of?** Both questions (3) and (4) entail attention to the social matrix of media texts.

In their methodology, Kress and van Leeuwen (1996) mainly concentrate on questions of image design, but do not thoroughly deal with questions of production, consumption and social determination. By and large, they focus on:

1. **The structure of representation:** which participants are represented and in which types of processes (e.g. narrative, conceptual) do they engage.

2. **The position of viewers:** how social relations and attitudes are created between the represented participants and viewers. For instance, constructing demands through visual contact (vs. offers when there is no gaze); more personal and intimate relations through close shots (vs. impersonality through longer shots); or detachment through oblique angles (vs. subjectivity and involvement with frontal angles).

---

7 Taking a broad conception of text, Fairclough maintains that “the analysis of media texts should include detailed attention to the language […] it should also include detailed analysis of visual images and sound effects” (1995b: 33). Even in more recent work, Fairclough has remained loyal to such a multimodal approach to texts “because texts such as television programmes involve not only language but also images and sound effects” (2003: 3).

8 Narrative processes involve ongoing actions or events, where actors are represented by means of vectors – either real or imaginary – doing something in relation to each other. Conceptual processes entail a classification or analysis of participants in terms of their stable and timeless essence, for instance, graphics, diagrams, etc.
(3) *Modality*\(^9\). In their – particular – approach to the notion of modality, Kress and van Leeuwen (1996: 159) assume that images reflect reality in a more or less truthful or factual way depending on their colour range and saturation, contextualisation, abstraction, depth, illumination or brightness.

(4) *The meaning of composition*: how visual information is structured in terms of given/known (on the left) and new (on the right); real (at the bottom) and ideal (at the top); salience (through size, colour or fronting); etc.

By and large, the methodological framework devised for this preliminary study integrates Fairclough’s (1995b) and Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) analytical variables in an attempt to account for the multimodal nature of the advertisements. All in all, this approach has been devised following Kress and van Leeuwen’s (2001: 4-8 and *passim*) recommendation that any examination of multimodality in contemporary communication should involve an analysis of discourse design, production and consumption as fundamental issues. Nonetheless, we are well aware that, especially as far as the analysis of image is concerned, such analytical categories might not hold up to empirical testing. The framework that will be used is thus as follows:

1. *Discourse design*: how are specific media-discourse instances constructed by integrating image and language in terms of representations, identities and relations, attitudes and distribution of information?

1.1. *Representations*: which participants and processes are represented in images and language? What is the role of presupposition?

1.2. *Negotiating identities and relations between discourse producers and consumers*: what kind of social relations are constructed between represented participants and readers/viewers in the representation – both visually (by means of eye contact, shots and angles) and linguistically (through lexis and register)?

1.3. *Attitudes*: what attitudes are projected in the representation of reality carried out in the discourse analysed through image (e.g. abstraction, veracity)? What attitudes are projected in the representation of reality carried out in the discourse analysed through language (e.g. possibility, obligations)?

---

\(^9\) For systemic-functional linguistics, modality may be understood as the speaker’s attitude towards the proposition expressed in an utterance: “intermediate degrees, between the positive and negative poles, are known as MODALITY” (Halliday 1994: 88).
1.4. *Information value*: what is the information value in discursive products in terms of given-and-new, real-and-ideal, fronting? How do language and image interplay here?

As substantiated by the application of this framework below, any analytical categories which can be directly recognised from the objects of analysis will be separated out from potential explanatory categories for those analytic categories’ interpretations. For example, analytical categories like degrees of eye contact, shots or angles will be differentiated from explanatory categories like the construction of offers/demands, intimacy/interpersonality and involvement/detachment respectively. This is also the case when it comes to interpreting the articulation of a certain modality in images – through explanatory categories like realism or veracity – on the basis of analytical categories directly identified like colour range, saturation, contextualisation, etc. The same applies to the position of participants on the page and its information value in terms of given/new, real/ideal, etc.

2. *Discourse production and consumption*: how does the production and consumption of this type of discourse function in positioning readers/viewers?

3. *Discourse as socio-cultural practice*: what is the social matrix and underlying ideology of the discursive instance analysed?

As indicated in the introduction to the paper above, this contribution is but a preliminary study aiming to make explicit, and disentangle, the hypothesis that image/text combinations are contributing to the discursive construction of masculinity in British men’s magazines scent advertisements. So, this paper is solely a programmatic investigation aiming at fixing some categories for further study based on a larger corpus of advertisements, thereby adhering to the methodological approach of papers like Holsanova, Rahm Holmqvist (2006), where the very programmatic suggestions in social semiotics concerning information organisation are re-expressed as objectifiable claims prior to investigating them through eye tracking experiments; hence the choice of a small sample consisting of only nine advertisements.

The preliminary study herein conducted precisely on the basis of such a small sample of advertisements, and the programmatic investigation envisaged in this regard, will have significant methodological implications for the study undertaken. As a result, through the implementation of the methodological framework presented above to the advertisements scrutinised, the present study differentiates between the description of analytic categories that can be recognised directly from the objects of analysis (e.g. a colour range, or a position on the page) and potential explanatory categories for those analytic categories’ interpretations (e.g. a modality or an information value). Only after conducting further empirical work through larger corpus-based analyses – which is not the goal of this paper – will it be
possible to argue convincingly that any particular interpretations/explanations of the analytic categories actually hold with respect to the multimodal construction of masculinity in the genre examined. Since the present paper accounts only for a programmatic investigation intending to establish certain research directions for further corpus-based study, the contribution is not in a position to combine analytic categorisation and interpretation, so that it is to be noted that any interpretative comments will just be representative of the small sample analysed, rather than of the genre as a whole. Both Forceville (2007), in his review of in Baldry and Thibault (2005), and chapter 2 in Bateman (2008) advise of the negative results involved in making the jump from analytic categories directly recognised from the objects of analysis and potential explanatory categories for the interpretation of such analytic categories. Thus, any tentatively interpretative remarks – while derived from the analytic categories whose application to the sample of advertisements will contribute to setting up – should only be conceived of, if at all, as helping to state hypotheses that broader corpus analysis will have to investigate.

5. A PRELIMINARY STUDY OF MULTIMODAL DISCOURSE DESIGN IN MEN'S MAGAZINES' SCENT ADVERTISING: THE LANGUAGE AND IMAGE INTERPLAY

This preliminary analysis of male-fragrance advertising is based on a selection of advertisements (i.e. Calvin Klein’s *Eternity*, *Eternity for Men*, *Contradiction* and *Escape*; Paco Rabanne pour Homme; Davidoff’s *Good Life*; Rochas Man; Salvatore Ferragamo pour Homme; and Chanel’s *Allure*) published throughout the 1999 issues of British men’s magazines incorporating this type of advertising. Regardless of the limited quantitative nature of the sample of advertisements herein examined, they have been selected on grounds of their tendency to appear recurrently in the pages of general-interest magazines for men during this yearly period. All nine advertisements appeared randomly in *Arena*, *Esquire*, *FHM*, *GQ*, *Maxim* and *ZM* in different issues of the magazines throughout 1999. In order to reproduce them in the final appendix, the date when each advertisement was published in one of such lifestyle periodicals has been indicated.

5.1. DISCOURSE DESIGN

The following four sections focus on the process whereby male perfume advertising takes shape as a characteristic multimodal discourse on masculinity through a combination of image and language. In order to examine the discursive design activated in these advertisements, four variables have been taken into consideration as discussed by Kress and van Leeuwen (1996) and Fairclough (1995b) in their respective
frameworks herein integrated, that is: the representations; identities and relations, attitudes and the distribution of information.

Given that this is but a programmatic investigation based on a small sample of advertisements, the findings of the present preliminary study should only be read as contributing to establishing analytical categories for conducting further corpus-based analyses based on the hypotheses that the actual pilot study contributes to reifying. Therefore, the nature of this study only enables us to describe the analytic categories which may recognised directly from the advertisements, whereas their potential explanatory value, albeit presumed at times, will depend upon a broader corpus examination.

5.1.1. Representations

The visual representation in these instances of scent advertising involves the utilization of narrative processes on the whole. Apart from actual perfume bottles, this advertising draws upon the representation of human participants. In all the advertisements there exists a young man (advertisements 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8 and 9), usually represented alone in the form of a human participant acting as a reactor focusing his sight outside the composition (advertisements 5 and 7), or even closing his eyes (advertisement 4). As far as the combination of men – frequently attractive, smartly dressed and clean-shaven – with other participants is concerned, there are two major groupings: men and women in advertisements 2, 3, 6 and 8, and men and children in advertisement 1. Within the first group, men are phenomenon in 2 and perhaps 6. The latter is unclear – this is not probably the case and it could be alternatively grouped with advertisement 3. As it is, in advertisement 6, the male participant could be claimed to be represented as the object of action processes where he is tightly held by a woman. Advertisement 8 is a reflexive, of the looking-at-each-other type, that is, the only one where there is direct eye contact.

In order to make any interpretative claims regarding men’s gender roles in scent advertisements, a broader corpus analysis should be conducted. Otherwise no general results may be presented concerning the hypothetical construction of men in close relation with women through the participant-combination patterns herein identified. The same applies to the concerns about personal appearance and devotion to parenting duties as part of men’s representation. Admittedly, the fact that a man holds a child in advertisements like 1 does not necessarily construct men

---

10 Kress and van Leeuwen (1996: 74-75) distinguish two fundamental subcategories of narrative processes: (i) action processes, which entail the existence of vectors – real or imaginary – flowing from a participant called actor and sometimes directed towards another actor named goal; and (ii) reaction processes, where vectors flow from a participant labelled as reactor and may focus on another called phenomenon. The latter processes involve visual contact between participants.
as active and committed fathers. Indeed, not only would it be necessary to provide some psychological testing in this respect, but also – and perhaps more importantly – further corpus analyses to decide whether this one occurrence is typical of a class of occurrences showing that this is a significant feature of modern advertisements.

As far as the linguistic representation through processes is concerned, we tend to find material processes where *men* are goals – i.e. objects – of processes whose agents are the actual male perfume brands themselves, as in

(1) “Allure [actor] makes [material process] the man [goal]”
(advertisement 7)\(^{11}\).

In other words, in the small sample of advertisements analysed, language contributes to representing men as social actors constituted by the effect of the toiletries that they use. In a similar fashion to the visual representation of the images, linguistic representation through processes seems to indicate that personal-appearance artefacts such as perfume brands have a fundamental role in the discursive construction of masculinity articulated in the advertisements. The emphasis on many of these men’s fragrances being *new* significantly activates the presupposition that there is a large and changing market of male toiletries\(^{12}\):

(2) “Davidoff – Good Life – The *New* Fragrance for Men (advertisement 2)”.

(3) “Contradiction for Men – Introducing a *New* Fragrance for Men”
(advertisement 4)”.

(4) “Allure – The *New* Fragrance from Chanel” (advertisement 7)”.

Men would be apparently placed as active consumers and, as a result, highly concerned about personal appearance issues. However, it is probably a feature of a great many advertisements that their products are described as “new”. Given the preliminary-study nature of this analysis, there is no contrast set – for instance, in the form of advertisements of other products or images from other genres. Therefore,

\(^{11}\) According to systemic-functional linguistics, our perception of reality is constructed in the form of *goings-on* or processes involving different participants. Apart from other minor categories, Halliday’s (1994) taxonomy includes material processes, which have to do with the world of acting (e.g. go, run, take); mental, related to sensing (e.g. like, want, hear); relational, which refer to being and becoming (e.g. be, have, become); or strictly verbal, (e.g. say, suggest, advise). Material processes often include and *actor* responsible for the process itself, and a *goal* – sometimes referred to as object – upon which the actual process has a direct effect.

\(^{12}\) A presupposition is “something that the speaker assumes to be the case prior to making an utterance” (Yule 1996: 25).
further corpus-based analyses will have to pursue this interpretative hypothesis, for which there does not exist enough evidence in the sample herein examined.

5.1.2. Negotiating identities and relations

Considering the position of viewers, it has to be stressed that represented participants hardly ever – only in advertisement 1 – gaze at the viewers of these advertisements. In contrast, visual contact with viewers is virtually nonexistent (advertisements 2, 3, 5, 7 and 8), and male participants are even represented with their eyes closed (advertisements 4 and 6). We could therefore assume – and we are moving from description of what may be directly recognised from the advertisements to interpretation – that the producers of these advertisements addressed at an audience of male consumers have opted for promoting a type of man who, instead of demanding any immediate action on the part of consumers, happens to display an offering and devoted attitude towards potential fragrance purchasers. Surely, represented male participants in the sample come closer to the male viewers of these advertisements through close shots (advertisements 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8). Again, the analysis of a wider corpus should confirm this tendency and investigate the interpretative hypothesis that such close shots seek to hint at the existence of an intimate relation between both.

From a linguistic viewpoint, the hypothesis that there also seems to be a tendency towards the intimate would be consistent with some of the lexical choices employed to make reference to the type of toiletries advertised. In point of fact, the introduction of nominal phrases in French projects an aura of sensuality and intimacy over potential male perfume consumers. That is the case of eau de toilette, which has become a lexicalised phrase in contemporary English (Collins English Dictionary 1998: 1608):

(5) “Eternity for Men – Calvin Klein – Eau de Toilette” (advertisement 1).


The same tendency may be mentioned with the use of the expression pour homme (i.e. ‘for men’):

(7) “Salvatore Ferragamo pour homme” (advertisement 6).

---

13 Given that we have adopted Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) perspective for the examination of the visual, analyses of personalisation are based on their use of shots as an analytical category. Nonetheless, perhaps terms from film (e.g. close up, extreme close up, head+shoulders, half, ¾, American, etc.) in some form might have also served as analytic categories for this variable.
Cook insists in this regard that perfume manufacturers’ names rely on the effect of connotations, so that “even when the perfume is given a simple manufacturer’s name (Chanel, Armani) this carries the connotation of its country of origin” (2001: 107-108). This is the case of the connotations of romance and sophistication (Cook 2001: 110) evoked by French brand names. This tendency is actually manifested in masculine-scent advertisements like Paco Rabanne (no. 3), Rochas (no. 5) or Allure (no. 7), to which we could add the evocation of Mediterranean warmth surrounding Salvatore Ferragamo (no. 6) as an Italian brand name. In any case, minimal though they are, all these lexical features contribute to the use of language in the advertisements in accordance with a register whose tenor displays a significantly high affective relation between the advertisements’ producers and their readers through what traditionally has been labelled as an intimate style (Joos 1968: 188)14.

Regardless of the limitations of this preliminary study, a significant use of oblique angles in the images (advertisements 2, 3, 5, 7 and 9) may be said to characterise the perception of represented participants by male consumers. Further corpus analyses will have to confirm this tendency in order to investigate whether this may be interpreted as a form of detachment of male consumers from represented participants. At this stage, we may only hypothesise that the advertisements’ producers could have been aware that too close a contact between the men represented in these advertisements and viewers might trigger homoerotic interpretations among potential consumers, and many male viewers could feel uneasy with such an explicit display of male bodies in the advertisements. These advertisements are included in men’s lifestyle magazines targeted at – primarily – heterosexual ideal readers (cf. Edwards 1997: 76). In any case, it may be recognised directly from the advertisements that this phenomenon is stressed in some samples of the present study (no. 4, 6 and 8), where men are represented from a perpendicular angle vis-à-vis the viewers, which helps to direct the gaze of the former and the latter in opposite directions.

5.1.3. Attitudes

As the following examples illustrate, the language of the advertisements uses hardly any modality markers:

---

14 According to Biber and Conrad, “[linguistic] varieties defined in terms of general situational parameters are known as registers” (2001: 175). In addition to other parameters like mode and field, tenor is a key variable to identify registers and may be defined as “the relations among the participants in a language activity” (Crystal 1997: 384). Together with factors like power and contact relations between addressees and addressees, when delineating registers theorists like Eggins (1994: 64-65) have emphasized the importance of the affective relation between language users.
“Contradiction for Men – Introducing a New Fragrance from Calvin Klein” (advertisement 4).

“Allure Makes the Man – Allure – The New Men’s Fragrance from Channel” (advertisement 7).

“Salvatore Ferragamo pour Homme – Notice Everything” (advertisement 6).

Although the discourse of advertising tends to draw upon forms of deontic modality on a regular basis, “either for purposes of immediate action or to make us more favourably disposed in general terms to the advertised product or service” (Goddard 2002: 9) and thus create artificial needs on potential consumers, the lack of forms of deontic modality is outstanding in the print-media advertisements explored for this preliminary study. In special, it is noticeable that the imperative, which is regarded “as the unmarked member of the deontic system” (Palmer 1986: 108), is not used in the selection of advertisements examined with the exception of one of them:

“Salvatore Ferragamo pour Homme – Notice Everything” (advertisement 6).

Despite their frequency in advertising discourse in the form of “a ‘voice’ which appears to be speaking personally to the reader” (Goddard 2002: 24), the apparent lack of imperatives in this sample might be accounted for – and we are moving from description to potential interpretation – on the basis of the presumably aspirational image of masculinity projected from these advertisements; in other words, it could be argued that the design of the adverts is such that, rather than feeling that they are being persuaded to buy such toiletries, potential male consumers are conceivably being placed in a position where they are just being offered such fragrances for enjoyment. Nevertheless, this is but an initial hypothesis and further corpus-based analyses will have to investigate the lack of imperatives herein traced, and whether the one exception traced is significant or not.

As for the visual dimension of the advertisements, the images evidence a minimum saturation of colour (advertisements 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8 and 9) as well as quite a limited range of colours as well. Black and white prevails in the majority of the advertisements (advertisements 1, 2, 4, 6, 7, 8 and 9), despite this monochromatic tendency being sometimes slightly nuanced in advertisements designed on the basis of a very limited range of blues (advertisements 3 and 5).

---

As defined by Crystal (1997: 109), “deontic modality is concerned with the logic of obligation and permission”.

---

24 Estudios Ingleses de la Universidad Complutense

2009, vol. 17 9-36
Even though the range of brightness is not particularly rich (especially in advertisements 3 and 9), there is a significant play of lights and shadows in these images (advertisements 1, 3, 5, 7 and 9). In actual fact, the illumination, brightness and colours are far more developed in the bottles of scent than in the human figures represented (advertisements 2, 5, 6, 7 and, to a lesser extent, 3, 4 and 8). Also, there exists a remarkable lack of perspective and context in many of the images (advertisements 1, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8 and 9).

As with the remarks concerning linguistic modality above, the tendencies herein identified will have to be investigated through the analysis of a broader corpus of advertisements. So, no interpretative comments may be made at this point regarding the degree of truth or veracity of images in these advertisements not only because of the limitations of the present preliminary study in terms of quantitative data, but also because, as maintained by Kress and van Leeuwen (1996: 158), the notion of truth or factuality assigned to images depends on genre, historical placement and available technology. For instance, we may not assume that high technicolor is the clear sign of veracity since, for some genres and/or times, black-and-white would represent the highest. Thus, before any explanatory comments are possibly made as for the degree of realism in the advertisements, further investigation will have to be conducted on how colour distributions are perceived and used in the genre of these advertisements.

5.1.4. Information value

Taking into account the meaning of the visual composition in the advertisements, it is men who tend to be represented on the left of other human participants such as women or children (advertisements 1, 2, 3 and 8). Broader corpus analysis should then be carried out to look into this tendency and verify the hypothesis that from an information-structure perspective – we proceed to provide some potential interpretation for this analytical category in the advertisements – such dimensions as the attention to the feminine realm, couple relations or fathering could somehow be claimed to be constructed as new with regard to the representation of the masculine. Were this initial hypothesis to be confirmed, these perfume advertisements could be interpreted as representing a type of man characterised by his rapprochement with the feminine universe, the greater importance attached to relations with girlfriends or wives, and a more committed attitude towards fathering. In constructing such dimensions as new from an informative point of view in the images, they might accordingly be read as acquiring a fresh value for the masculine identities sketched in these male-scent advertisements. However, in spite of the limited sample herein examined, this is true apart from advertisement 6, so that general claims may not even be made in this respect until a broader corpus analysis confirms whether this 20% error rate – 5 advertisements show more than one participant – is just a one-off or a sign that
there are many of this kind. The analysis of a contrast set, be it in the form of advertisements of other products or images from other genres, will have to confirm these hypotheses.

On the other hand, bearing in mind the limited amount of actual text in the advertisements, it is hardly possible to explore the informative structure from a textual point of view and, consequently, make any claims as for what is given and new information, and what is placed in thematic and rhematic positions. Nevertheless, a textual analysis of the actual male perfume brands advertised in terms of the syntactic hierarchy of clause constituents evidences that the male scent brands invariably act as head of nominal phrases modified by prepositional phrases indicating the type of consumers of each fragrance, namely men\textsuperscript{16}. Such prepositional groups (i.e. for men) are syntactically subordinated to the head of the phrase:

\begin{itemize}
  \item (12) “Eternity for Men” (advertisement 1).
  \item (13) “Davidoff – Good Life – The New Fragrance for Men” (advertisement 2).
  \item (14) “Contradiction for Men” (advertisement 4).
  \item (15) “Salvatore Ferragamo pour Homme [i.e. ‘for men’]” (advertisement 6).
  \item (16) “Eternity – Calvin Klein Fragrances for Men” (advertisement 9).
  \item (17) “Escape for Men” (advertisement 9).
\end{itemize}

From a visual perspective, perfume bottles tend to be perceived to the right of men (advertisements 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7), which serves as a point of departure for articulating the hypothesis that concerns about personal looks would be a remarkably new dimension in men’s identities. Nonetheless, it is obvious that there is not enough evidence for arguing that textual representation in the advertisements comes to emphasize the centrality of personal-appearance artefacts in men’s assumed lifestyle. Indeed, there is a risk of potentially over-interpreting the position of perfume bottles in terms of given-new/ideal-real. As discussed by Kress\textsuperscript{16}

\textsuperscript{16} A head is “in x-bar theory, the part of a complex constituent x which is a lexical item of the same category type as x. Thus, the head of the noun phrase The bridge to San Francisco is the noun bridge. This lexical item is also known as the lexical head of the noun phrase” (Bussmann 1996: 203). On the other hand, a modifier is a “linguistic expression which more closely specifies or determines the meaning of another expression (\(\Rightarrow\) head) semantically and syntactically: long book, where book is the head and long is the modifier describing the book. [...] In English nouns are typically modified by adjectives (long book) or prepositional phrases (the book on the table)” (ibid, 309).
and van Leeuwen (1996: 193-202), elements placed at the bottom of images are usually associated with the sphere of the real, whereas those situated at the top of images are taken to be linked with ideal worlds. The frequent location of male-scent bottles at the bottom of the image (advertisements 2, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8) could misleadingly lead to interpreting this product of personal-appearance care as a tangible reality in men’s lives. Along the same lines, this could be claimed to be consistent with the salience of fragrance bottles in the images explored (advertisements 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8), thereby leading to an over-interpretation of their fronting position, colour and brightness – compared to the black-and-white human figures placed behind in the images (advertisements 2, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8) – as helping to construct a type of man highly preoccupied with his personal appearance and body care. However, not only is further corpus-based analysis necessary to make any general claims in this regard, but – more importantly – it may well be the case that the positioning of the bottles of perfume in the advertisements appears well motivated by production constraints (cf. Waller 1987; Bateman, Delin and Henschel 2007) and the underlying images. For example, if the bottles were anywhere else in advertisements 3, 4, 5 or 6, they would hardly be visible against the background. Similarly, in advertisement 7, putting the bottle anywhere would obscure the subject.

5.2. FROM DISCOURSE DESIGN TO DISCOURSE PRODUCTION AND CONSUMPTION

Assuming the constitution of discourses around institutional sites, some discourse theorists have underlined that “there can also be discourses that develop around a specific topic, such as gender or class” (Davies and Harré 1990: 45), which makes it possible to speak of ‘gendered discourses’ articulated in society by actually “positioning women and men in certain ways” (Sunderland 2004: 21). In particular, Mills posits that “we can assume that there is a set of discourses of femininity and masculinity, because women and men behave within a certain range of parameters when defining themselves as gendered subjects” (1997: 17). In accordance with the role of the mass media as one of the richest areas of representation of gender identities (Branston and Stafford 1996: 78), perfume advertising in British men’s magazines arguably comes to activate a discourse on masculinity – multimodally designed through a characteristic interaction of language and image – in a mass-media vehicle addressed at and consumed by an audience of men. Although a broader sample of data should be analysed to ascertain the specificity of these advertisements and differences with others, the sections above have hinted at how this type of advertising discourse is multimodally constructed – in terms of its combination of text and image – in men’s magazines.
As highlighted by Cook in his exploration of the discourse of advertising, more than other commodities perfume is “both marketed and perceived as expressions of the self and sexuality” (2001: 106). Semiotic products like these male-fragrance advertisements are to be regarded as textual manifestations of wider discursive practices. Although a broader corpus of advertisements should be examined to confirm the hypotheses shaped by the limited sample herein explored, this particular form of discourse seems to distance itself from patriarchal constructions of masculinity and entice men to become social subjects in close contact with women, preoccupied with their looks, and committed towards fathering. Such features have come to define the ideological repertoire of the so-called new man, a major subject position or image of masculinity often found in contemporary popular-culture British genres, and representing “the ideal partner for the modern, liberated, heterosexual woman […] a softer, more sensitive and caring individual, who also avoids sexist language, changes nappies and loves to shop all day for his own clothes” (Edley and Wetherell 1997: 204)17. Further analyses of a larger sample will admittedly have to discern whether the hypotheses made explicit through this preliminary study may be confirmed, and to what extent such constructions of masculinity differ from earlier studies (cf. Goffman 1979; Bell and Milic 2002).

Along with these instances of male scent advertising, this type of discourse is produced in other genres within men’s magazines, including articles, problem pages and narratives, and in the advertising of other male commodities. In reading and viewing such advertisements, actual magazine consumers are – at least temporarily – positioned as sharing the systems of values and beliefs of the new man, and are invited to purchase such toiletries as representative and constitutive of the newmannist identity project that ideal magazine readers/viewers are assumed to partake of and aim at18. The magazines’ editorial boards have without doubt included such instances of advertising as reproducing the assumed lifestyle of ideal readers. As McLoughlin puts it, “magazines are a means of presenting ideal-reader images to which the purchaser can aspire” (2000: 95), so that the publication of these male-scent advertisements in men’s magazines comes to construct masculinity models for the viewers and potential consumers of these commodities. As a matter of fact, the discourse of advertising is characterised by the creation of ideal-consumer communities sharing an ideology which advertisements attempt to activate. In Delin’s (2002: 124) viewpoint,

17 Subject positions may be metaphorically defined “in terms of the empty spaces or functions in discourse from which the world makes sense” (Barker 2004: 194), and may be characterized as incorporating “both a conceptual repertoire and a location for persons within the structure of rights for those that use that repertoire […] within the particular discursive practice in which they are positioned” (Davies and Harré 1990: 46).

18 Taking the post-structuralist tenet that discourses create subject positions with which actual individuals negotiate their own identities, Hall has seen identities as “points of temporary attachment to the subject positions that discursive practices construct for us” (2000: 19).
It is also relevant to see these groups as constructed consumption communities. These are idealizations of what people are really like, and advertisements based on these idealizations might therefore be argued to be performing ideological work in bringing these groupings into being through the messages they convey.

6. CONCLUSION: BRIDGING THE GAP BETWEEN MULTIMODAL DISCOURSE AND CONTEMPORARY MASCULINE CULTURES IN MEN’S MAGAZINES’ SCENT ADVERTISING

As underlined by Fairclough (1989: 25 and passim; 1995b: 203-204), any discursive instance – be it language, image or a combination of both – takes shape as part of social interactions among individuals comprising processes of textual production and consumption. Such interactions – in this case reading/viewing this form of male-scent advertising within men’s magazines – may be conceived of as part of wider socio-cultural phenomena with a social matrix, involving power relations, embodying ideologies and positioning individuals as social subjects. Considering current discourses on masculinity in the UK, various authors (e.g. Horrocks 1994; Edwards 1997; Clare 2001) echo the progressive constitution of a certain crisis of traditionally hegemonic masculinities over the past few decades resulting from the impingement of second-wave feminism, women’s deeper access to power, and the impact of consumerism upon men.

Popular-culture vehicles in Britain like television, the press and advertising – by way of example in men’s magazines – have greatly contributed to the articulation of discourses representing new masculinities in the form of subject positions made available for individuals to negotiate their identities as men. The appearance of such discourses in male perfume advertising would be hardly surprising, for, since its appearance in the early nineties, the “regime of looking was central to the distinctiveness of the ‘new man’ imagery as a whole” (Nixon 1996: 201)19. The potential invocation of a so-called ‘new man’ subject position in the advertising of toiletries like male perfume could thus be interpreted as a commercial strategy of discourse producers whereby actual readers/viewers are invited to emulate, and actually activate, this image of masculinity by using the toiletries advertised. However, given the programmatic nature of this preliminary study aiming to fix analytical categories for a broader-corpus analyses of advertisements, we are not yet in a position to claim any major differences between contemporary masculinity discourses and men’s magazine advertising.

19 Exploring the relation between the so-called new man discourses and men’s magazines in Britain during the nineties, Nixon claims that “if we think about the contemporary ‘new man’ images, it is clear that press and television advertising and consumer magazines played an important role in helping to construct this regime” (1997: 327).
constructions of masculinity in genres like this and earlier gender advertisements (cf. Goffman 1979; Bell and Milic 2002), which additional investigations will need to pursue.

The preliminary study undertaken herein has contributed to making explicit the assumption that different features of the advertisements examined shadow this – arguably – ‘newmannist’ image of masculinity through a multimodal design. Although the limited sample of advertisements explored in this analysis – and chiefly its preliminary-study scope – does not yet allow reporting hard-and-fast results, some initial hypotheses regarding the multimodal construction of masculinity in the genre have been made explicit – and unravelled. In other words, this pilot study has shed light on the validity of certain analytical categories, and their potential interpretative value, which further corpus-based analyses would need to pursue, thereby contributing to delineate research directions for further detailed analyses. Although the results of the preliminary study in section 5.1. above account for such – at this stage reified – hypotheses in a more detailed way, some of those initial directions of research on discourse design are as follows:

Firstly, as far as representations are concerned, further research should investigate how the combination of participants in images – men, women and children – through narrative processes contributes to constructing gender roles, chiefly for men, and in which ways different types of processes (i.e. action, reaction, etc.) and participant roles are significant from a gender-identity perspective. In a similar way, future research should examine the participant roles for men, and their relation with other participants (perfume brands but also other human participants if necessary), through linguistic processes.

Secondly, as for the negotiation of identities and relations, broader corpus-based investigations should confirm the lack of visual contact, including cases when represented participants close their eyes, and close shots – perhaps in combination with other analytical categories developed for film – and their potential interpretation as categories promoting an intimate relation between represented participants and viewers in the advertisements. In addition, future analyses should study whether different lexical features contribute to using an intimate register in language. Furthermore, the use of oblique – and to a lesser extent perpendicular – angles should be similarly investigated as seemingly serving to detach viewers from represented participants, thereby avoiding potentially homoerotic connotations.

Thirdly, it is to be stressed that we are not yet in a position to compare the use of modality markers in the verbal language and the kind of analysis suggested by the application of Kress and van Leeuwen’s proposals for, by way of example, colour-based modality in image – let alone to decide whether they align or go against each other and why when attempting to ‘read’ attitudes in these advertisements. However, broader corpus research should investigate whether imperatives are consistently avoided in these advertisements, so as to confirm the plausible interpretation that potential male consumers are just placed in a position
where they are invited to enjoy, rather than persuaded to buy, the fragrances advertised. Moreover, prior to attempting to explain the degree of image realism on the basis of Kress and van Leeuwen’s approach to modality in visuals, detailed studies will have to be carried out on how colour distributions are perceived and used in the genre of these advertisements.

Fourthly, from an information-value viewpoint, the study of a larger sample will be necessary to gain an insight into the function of men’s position on the left of other participants – and the exception identified in the small sample herein analysed – as well as its gender-construction implications in terms of which dimensions of men’s lifestyle are represented as given/new. Likewise, the positioning and salience of the bottles of perfume in the advertisements should also be inspected in terms of their motivation by production constraints and the underlying images.

In short, the present study – albeit hardly representative in its results due to its scope – has made explicit some initial hypotheses on how language and image are jointly drawn upon to configure gendered discourses on masculinity in a multimodal fashion. In point of fact, the combined utilization of social semiotics and CDA in this paper has – successfully – contributed to opening up research directions, and chiefly fixing certain analytical categories, for exploring – through further corpus-based investigations along the lines herein delineated – how both modes are used together to produce multimodal discourses on masculinity in men’s magazines’ scent advertising. Such investigations, based on a broader sample of other data, will then have to report specific results regarding the multimodal construction of masculine identity in this genre, thereby pointing out differences between these advertisements and others, which – given the scope and purpose of this preliminary study – still may not be possibly ascertained.

REFERENCES


APPENDIX: MAGAZINES’ MALE-SCENT ADVERTISEMENTS ANALYSED